EVALUATION OF ALL AGE GUIDANCE PROJECTS

SQW with TNS

The Scottish Executive Social Research
2005
Department of Enterprise, Transport and Lifelong Learning
This report is available on the Scottish Executive Social Research website only www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch.

The views expressed in this report are those of the researchers and do not necessarily represent those of the Department or Scottish Ministers.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION
1. The provision of careers information, advice and guidance has, over the past five years, become an increasingly important theme within public policy, particularly in relation to the promotion of the concept of lifelong learning. In 2000, the Scottish Executive announced the provision of almost £9m of funding for the development of All Age Guidance (AAG) services. These were projects set up to provide a single source of information, advice and guidance on careers, training and education in each region for people of all ages. In early 2001, the Duffner Committee report followed by the Scottish Executive response, proposed the introduction of Careers Scotland which after its launch took responsibility for delivering the AAG projects and developing a national service.

2. The rationale for the provision of careers development support is both economic and social. The economic benefits relate to improvements in the functioning of the labour market leading to increasing productivity in the economy and providing a more rewarding experience for individuals. There are also specific arguments for improving guidance to people excluded from traditional labour market processes in terms of increasing the pool of available labour as well as in terms of social justice. Overall, the changing nature of labour markets means that transitions are made by individuals more often and at varying stages of their lives.

POLICY
3. Recent work by the OECD concludes that effective career development guidance systems are crucial if government education and employment policies are to work and there is a similar emphasis within the EC. It is a theme which Scotland’s policy makers have also embraced. The Scottish Executive’s Lifelong Learning Strategy, Life Through Learning: Learning Through Life (2003) has a strategic goal of supporting “A Scotland where people are given the information, guidance and support they need to make effective learning decisions and transitions”.

4. Smart Successful Scotland, the strategy for the Scottish Enterprise Network, also recognises the role of career development guidance in the context of economic development. It suggests that “the capacity to respond rapidly to the current and future needs of the Scottish labour market is critical to success in an age of lifelong learning. Those economies most adept at matching supply and demand in the labour market will possess a key competitive advantage”. One of the levers to delivering this, it says, “is the creation of a one-stop, all-age Careers Advice Service”.

1
5. Finally, the AAG Projects also contribute to several of the Executive’s Closing the Opportunity Gap targets by supporting the reduction of unemployment among working age people and specifically by contributing to raising the employment rates of groups, such as lone parents and ethnic minorities, that are relatively disadvantaged in the labour market.

**KEY RESULTS**

6. Our report concludes that the All Age Guidance projects have delivered substantial benefits to clients. This is not confined to the tangible outcomes that the surveys identify, but extends to benefits in terms of the career planning skills that clients have developed. The longitudinal structure of this work has allowed us to demonstrate how the benefits have continued to accumulate months after contact with Careers Scotland.

7. The AAG projects also contribute substantially to public policy objectives. In terms of Smart Successful Scotland’s objective of matching supply and demand in the labour market, of almost 40,000 people that used the service in 2002/03, we estimate that 25,800 started a new job within nine months. Of these, 17,000 (66%) reported that the information, advice and guidance had been *an influence* on their decision.

8. The research found that the majority of clients:

- reported that the support influenced their career decisions
- felt that they now had more confidence to make career development decisions
- believed that the support had provided a significant enhancement to their career prospects.

9. More informed decision making will lead to a better match between individuals and employers. This will contribute to an improvement in the operation of the labour market and ultimately to increased productivity (although demonstrating the economic efficiency gains of this matching is more difficult).

10. In terms of Lifelong Learning, the research shows that:

- the percentage of the Scottish adult population who would find advice or guidance about careers, about training or about other learning opportunities very useful rose from 12% to 21% between March 2002 and April 2004. A major step change in attitude took place at the time of the Career Scotland advertising campaign in 2003.

- 17,500 AAG clients had started and/or completed a training or education course, of which 13,112 had been influenced by the information, advice and guidance provided through the AAG projects.
11. These findings show how the projects have directly provided clients with the information, guidance and support they need to make effective learning decisions and transitions (a Scottish Lifelong Strategy goal). Equally importantly, the support has influenced clients’ decisions.

12. The projects also contribute to several of the Executive’s Closing the Opportunity Gap targets. The analysis shows that the support had a greater effect on older people (+45) and single parents in particular, enhancing their skills, confidence and employment prospects. While 38% of the full sample believed the information, advice or guidance they received had affected their decisions a lot, this figure was 42% among those over 45 and 58% for single parents.

THE EVALUATION
13. The evaluation of the AAG projects began in late 2001, although the formation of Careers Scotland and its launch in April in 2002 significantly changed the methodology and shape of the work. This was restructured as a longitudinal study involving:

• an initial telephone survey of 559 AAG participants carried out in February 2003, three months after clients’ contact with Career Scotland

• a second telephone survey of 371 of the same participants carried six months later between July and September 2003

• a programme of 36 face to face interviews with a subset of these participants carried out over March and April 2004

• an omnibus survey of the Scottish population, carried out every six months from April 2002 to March 2004, to assess interest in careers information and advice and the profile of Career Scotland.

14. The research and the results reported here take a national view of AAG and the impact that it has had on a single cohort of clients that used the service in August/September 2001. By using two sets of interviews with the same clients we have been able to examine not only the short term impact of the support that they received, but also effects that occurred over the next nine months.

OUTCOMES
15. The results of the surveys demonstrate a significant number of measurable outcomes achieved since first contact with the AAG project. As importantly, the number achieving employment or training and learning outcomes continued to increase over time. While after three months 31% had started a new job, after nine months this had risen to 65%.
16. One of the key findings of this research is the extent to which the number undertaking follow up actions or finding jobs, training and financial support has grown over the nine months from the initial contact with the service. Equally significant is the fact that the influence of Careers Scotland on these outcomes remained at least as high six months after they last had contact with an adviser.

**After three months…..**
- 68% had applied for a job and 33% had started a new job
- 43% had applied for a training or education course and 26% had completed a course
- 23% have looked into financial support and 10% have been successful
- 7% reported no outcome

**After nine months…..**
- 83% had applied for a job and 65% had started a new job
- 60% had applied for a training or education course and 44% had started or completed a course
- 38% have looked into financial support and 18% have been successful
- 2% had no outcome after nine months

17. We also estimate that 55% of single parents started a job over the nine month period. Based on this group being 8% of the sample, this would equate to 1,748 clients.

18. Further evidence of these outcomes and the fact they continued to shift over the nine months of the study is provided by the tracking of clients’ economic status. This showed those in employment rising from 46% to 72% of the sample, while the proportion of unemployed fell from 50% to 16%.
19. The face to face interviews provided a more refined picture of how contact with the AAG service in late 2002 has impacted on the lives of the participants. The most noticeable factor was the unpredictability of career development and the wide variety of cases that used the service. In nearly all the cases there were positive changes in status over the period, but the outcomes were often very different from original plans. This reinforces the role of the adviser in developing more generic career development skills rather than advising on specific sectors.

20. Despite the major changes that had occurred in the interviewees’ lives nearly all believed that the AAG service had positively influenced their career decisions. The impression was that the majority of the participants are now in a better position or engaged in a more satisfying career than prior to their contact with the service. The case studies in the report provide examples of individuals who, in some cases, have made major career changes into areas where they are more content. In other cases, the guidance has influenced them not to follow specific career paths. These are positive outcomes both for the economy (as participants have found jobs or are training for jobs which better reflect their strengths) and for them personally. This is true even when individuals avoid wasting time following inappropriate ideas.

Key outcomes

Because Careers Scotland were able to collect data on the number of clients from day one, we are able to apply the results to the full client base over the year April 2002 to April 2003, the period over which the clients interviewed used the service. In total 39,732 received AAG support. This suggests that the AAG projects have had an influence on:

- 66% of those starting a job/new job or 17,045 clients
- 70% of those applying for a job or 23,084 clients
- 75% of those starting or completing a training or education course or 13,112 clients
- 77% on those applying for a training or education course or 18,356 clients
- 71% of those finding additional financial support or 5,078 clients
- 75% of those making new or better care arrangements or 1,788 clients
- Although 9% of the baseline survey reported no outcome at that stage, after nine months only 2% of the sample reported no outcome at all.
- 75% of single parents starting a job/new job or 1,311 clients
OUTPUTS

21. The AAG projects have worked with 39,732 clients split almost equally between men and women. There is evidence that the projects attracted a large proportion of those in work (40% of the sample were in either full or part-time work at the time they contacted the project), women with dependent children (30% of women in the sample have dependent children) and single parents (8%). The projects also attracted higher proportions of socio-economic groups C1 and DE than are represented in the adult population. The large proportion of DEs (49%) provides evidence that the projects have been able to attract some of the more socially excluded groups that they targeted in the individual bids.

Services and support

- A large majority of the clients contacting the projects did so to discuss possible careers options or career planning (78%) and most information was provided verbally during face to face interviews (87%) or in leaflets (69%). For advice and guidance, 93% of the sample had spent time with an advisor.

- For the clients interviewed, the service was largely driven by traditional approaches involving face to face interviews. This is no longer the case as Careers Scotland has developed its market segmentation model to distinguish between the approaches to be adopted for different groups of clients. It will be interesting to see how this impacts on the types of activities delivered (and on the impacts).

- Satisfaction with the services, including access, was universally high. In the interim report we suggested that it may be difficult to maintain this level of satisfaction as the number of clients grows. The experience of those interviewed in the follow up survey suggests this has not been the case and, although the sample was small (very few clients had contacted Careers Scotland again between the two interviews) respondents considered the service to have been, if anything, marginally better than six months previously.

- The emphasis on tailoring support to client needs is one of the characteristics of the service that has come across strongly from the surveys and has made a major contribution to the high levels of satisfaction. The case studies regularly make reference to the way interviewees were treated as individuals and given the time and support they needed. It is important that however the service develops, this sense is retained, although there is clearly a balance to be struck between the numbers of clients served and the resources that can be allocated.
ADDITIONALITY

22. In chapter two the report discusses some of the issues related to additionality and the indications of its strength. The sharp rise in client numbers in the final quarter of the financial year to April 2003 and the rising level of brand awareness evidenced in chapter three suggests that the projects and particularly the marketing carried out by Careers Scotland has brought in a significant number of new clients.

23. However, it is likely that many of the new clients would have progressed into employment, education or training regardless of the Careers Scotland advice and support. After all, according to the ONS claimant data for Scotland in 2002, typically around 70% of those on the claimant register would expect to find employment within six months. The issue is, therefore, whether Careers Scotland helped clients to progress more quickly and/or to develop a range of skills that allowed them to find appropriate or better quality training, education and careers. The evaluation evidence suggested that many of those who were unemployed when they first used the AAG service may well have found some kind of employment anyway, but it also indicated that the influence of the service on decision making was such that we can conclude that outcomes achieved were different from those that would have been achieved without the service, pointing to a better match between individuals and jobs. The fact that 70% of clients considered the support to have improved their future employment prospects also suggests that they believe that they have achieved a more positive outcome than otherwise.

24. At a national level, therefore, there is evidence of more people making more informed decisions, including specific groups that would previously have found access to information, advice and guidance more difficult. The projects have influenced outcomes, which are perceived by clients to be better than otherwise. They have also enhanced skills and confidence which, in the longer term, will strengthen the labour market.

RAISING AWARENESS

25. The measurement of awareness using the six monthly omnibus survey indicated two main points:

- The percentage of people who would find advice or guidance about careers, about training or about other learning opportunities very useful rose from 12% to 21% between March 2002 and April 2004. This is just over a fifth of the adult population.

- The percentage that had heard of Careers Scotland rose from 37% to 76% of the population between March 2002 and April 2004. This compares with 85% who have heard of Learndirect Scotland and 80% who have heard of the Job Centres. The advertising
campaign is no doubt responsible for the step increase in awareness between October 2002 and April 2003.

26. Within two years Careers Scotland has played a major part in raising awareness of advice or guidance about careers. While a high proportion of people are now aware of its existence, the data also suggests that most people would still approach the Job Centre or local colleges/learning institutions for careers advice and guidance. Having successfully raised awareness of the name, the results suggest that the next stage is to increase the public’s knowledge of the services that it provides.

CONCLUSIONS AND OBSERVATIONS

27. From the start, as noted in the interim report, the speed with which the AAG Project bids were prepared and partners brought together helped push adult guidance rapidly up the agenda and made people think about alternative approaches and methods of delivery. The capacity building and particularly the recruitment that was undertaken as part of this process provided Careers Scotland with a larger pool of people to work with and a base to build on when it was launched in 2002.

28. Realigning the regional projects into a single consistent service was a major challenge for Careers Scotland. The method of bidding for funds and the lack of cohesiveness and consistency in bids made it difficult to bring the projects together and it is to Careers Scotland’s credit that not only has this been done, but that the evidence from those that used the service in its infancy was so positive.

29. While the results show significant activity and changes in the status of clients, equally important given Careers Scotland’s role, are the proportions that feel more confident about their career development as a result of the support. It would be expected that, even without support, a proportion of those unemployed would find jobs or training. What is impressive in these results is that the majority of clients:

• reported that the support influenced their career decisions for the better
• felt that they now had more confidence to make career development decisions
• believed that the support had provided a significant enhancement to their career prospects.

30. Although the direction that individuals’ careers took were highly unpredictable, most interviewees stressed the value of the support they had received, even where it seemed to be unconnected with the outcome. This highlights the importance of building the generic skills of clients, the time that careers advisers were able to give and the confidence that this
instilled in clients. The importance of discussing options, even where they are rejected, was considered valuable.

31. A further encouraging feature has been the longevity of the effect of the support. Even after nine months, clients recalled it and most were able to credit it with influence on the eventual outcome. Not only were the outcomes sustainable, there was a continuing improvement over time. This would not have been apparent from a single point evaluation and suggests that future work should, where possible, try to capture these longer term effects or at least recognise their existence.

32. The omnibus survey has demonstrated the growing interest in careers information, advice and guidance and in Careers Scotland itself. Much of this is likely to be the result of Careers Scotland’s awareness raising and promotional activities, particularly the national advertising campaign. This was reflected in the increase in clients in the third quarter of 2002/03. As demand increases, there will be implications for Careers Scotland’s targeting and delivery process, in particular its adoption of a market segmentation approach that targets particular categories of support to different types of clients. Clearly, a balance will need to be struck between providing a standard service and bespoking the service where appropriate for specific client groups. The research suggested that the reasons for the very high levels of satisfaction have been the willingness of advisers to spend time with clients and the extent to which the support was tailored. This certainly appeared to be one of the strengths of the model and should be borne in mind in the future development of the service.

33. A second effect of the increasing demand for the service is that the expectations of the public can be expected to rise. These expectations will need to be managed and met in the context of limited resources by the promotion and adoption of alternative delivery mechanisms - use of internet tools, group working and other means of accessing information and advice. Our sample almost all had face to face contact with an adviser and appreciated it and it will be interesting to see whether the same level of satisfaction can be achieved from a wider range of service delivery mechanisms.

34. From the Duffner Committee report to today, there has been a sea change in the availability and delivery of careers development support. The Committee’s role in identifying the importance of these issues has been supported by the value attached to careers support by a very high proportion of clients (and an increasing proportion of the public). The evaluation shows that these services have made a major impact on the career development of a large number of people, both in terms of finding suitable employment and training and, just as importantly, providing the support, skills and confidence to make informed career decisions. Against the backdrop of substantial organisational change, this must be seen as a major success for all those involved.
CHAPTER ONE   RESEARCH CONTEXT

INTRODUCTION

1.1 This evaluation of the All Age Guidance Projects was commissioned by the Scottish Executive in 2001. The results, reported in full in this report and appendices, show that the projects have delivered many positive outcomes for its clients and that it has had a very significant influence on the career development of those that used the service. Allied with the high levels of satisfaction and the evidence of rising awareness of careers information, advice and guidance among the Scottish population, we have concluded that the projects have been a significant success. This is all the more creditable given the significant organisational changes that took place over the period.

RATIONALE

1.2 The rationale for the AAG projects is both economic and social and is rooted in the concept of lifelong learning. The economic case for the provision of guidance services is made in The Potential for Guidance: Ideas from economics\(^1\). Broadly, the economic benefits relate to improvements in the functioning of the labour market as a result of providing information and advice to individuals that will help optimise career decisions. This in turn will help improve the match between skills and work, increasing productivity in the economy and providing a more rewarding experience for individuals. There are specific arguments for improving guidance to people excluded from traditional labour market processes. These can be made both in terms of increasing the pool of available labour as well as in terms of social justice and raising the quality of life for specific groups.

1.3 Arguments for extending advice and guidance services are set out in the Career Service Review Committee report which explains the case for change. In the past the focus of the Careers Service has tended to be on the first destination of those leaving secondary school rather than on developing employability skills and providing career guidance at all transition points. The changing trends in the labour market and the economy mean that transitions are made by individuals at varying stages of their lives, often much later than was previously the case. Careers no longer follow traditional paths. They are becoming more complex, more flexible and specific to the individual. Furthermore, as lifelong learning becomes embedded

\(^1\) The potential for guidance ideas from economics, Michael White, Policy Studies Institute (1992).
and individuals change careers more frequently, the delivery of career guidance available to all ages becomes more critical.

**POLICY BACKGROUND**

1.4 The provision of careers information, advice and guidance in Scotland has come a long way in the last four years. It has increasingly been recognised as a major contributor both to the operation of the labour market, the national economy and to the quality of life of Scotland’s residents. This rising importance reflects similar policy emphasis internationally. A major OECD study released in 2004, comments that “in a world of constant change young people entering the labour market need the skills to manage their careers, and so do adults facing new job requirements. Governments in OECD countries are promoting active employment and lifelong learning policies to help their citizens cope with complex education systems and changing labour markets. But they need effective career guidance systems if their education and employment policies are to work.”

2. Within the EU, there has been a similar interest, particularly in relation to Lifelong Learning policy, the argument being that for EU countries to develop lifelong learning, the provision of all age information, advice and guidance is fundamental. A keystone of its social action programme is to encourage individuals to take responsibility for their own re-skilling and updating of knowledge.

1.5 The role of information and career development guidance is also emphasised in the Scottish Executive’s Lifelong Learning Strategy, *Life Through Learning: Learning Through Life*, launched in 2003. This has a strategic goal of supporting “A Scotland where people are given the information, guidance and support they need to make effective learning decisions and transitions”. Smart Successful Scotland, the strategy for the Scottish Enterprise Network, also makes reference to the role of career development guidance in the context of economic development. It suggests that “the capacity to respond rapidly to the current and future needs of the Scottish labour market is critical to success in an age of lifelong learning. Those economies most adept at matching supply and demand in the labour market will possess a key competitive advantage”. One of the levers to delivering this, it says, “is the creation of a one-stop, all-age Careers Advice Service”.

1.6 Finally, the AAG Projects also contribute to several of the Executive’s Closing the Opportunity Gap targets by contributing to the reduction of unemployment among working age people and specifically by contributing to raising the employment rates of groups, such as

---

lone parents and ethnic minorities, that are relatively disadvantaged in the labour market. This has been achieved by providing access to information and guidance that previously was only available on a more limited basis.

1.7 At every level careers information and guidance has, over the past five years, come to be seen as fundamental to encouraging lifelong learning and contributing to economic development. The development of the All Age Guidance projects, the Duffner report and the subsequent launch of Careers Scotland in 2002, show Scotland to be responding positively to these challenges.

**PROJECT BACKGROUND**

1.8 On the 6th October 1999, the First Minister announced a Review of the Careers Service in Scotland. The Review Committee, chaired by Barbara Duffner, submitted a final report containing a number of recommendations upon which the Scottish Executive invited comment during a period of consultation. There was a broad consensus of support for the key recommendations arising from the report and the Executive published its response in April 2001. The decision was taken to align the Careers Service, Education Business Partnerships (EBPs), Adult Guidance Networks (AGNs) and Local Learning Partnerships (LLPs) with the two Enterprise Networks of the Highlands and Islands (HIE) and Scottish Enterprise (SE). This resulted in a new organisation, Careers Scotland, which was operational from April 2002, with a national focus, standards, vision and brand.

1.9 Prior to the Duffner Committee Report, the Scottish Executive announced the provision of almost £9m of funding for the development of All Age Guidance (AAG) services and bids from the Career Service Companies and their partners were invited. The proposals were completed in early 2001. Although separate bids were submitted for the Highlands and each of the island areas, these were subsequently brought together as a single document for the Highlands and Islands Enterprise area. The projects were to run for three years, to April 2004.

1.10 The bids submitted and eventually agreed by the Scottish Executive over the first half of 2001 each considered the local conditions and proposed activities to deliver AAG services. In some areas existing provision was reasonably good (Central, Renfrewshire and Orkney) and in others, extremely limited (Borders and Dumfries and Galloway). While these were

---

being assessed, the Duffner report, followed by the Scottish Executive response, proposed the introduction of Careers Scotland to operate alongside the Enterprise Networks. Most of the projects began in June 2001, but there were delays in the introduction of several, as staff were recruited and plans agreed and finalised. Once Careers Scotland was introduced in April the following year, delivery of the AAG projects became their responsibility.

1.11 The evaluation of the AAG projects was carried out in tandem with an evaluation of the Beattie inclusiveness projects, which were launched at the same time and have also been led by Careers Scotland.

OBJECTIVES

1.12 The strategic and operational objectives of the initiatives (AAG and inclusiveness projects) are:

- to improve skills and employability of Scotland’s most disadvantaged young people
- to raise awareness of and access to advice and guidance services to facilitate entry and re-entry to the labour market
- to improve access and opportunities to raise skill levels and achieve full potential of people of all ages in the Scottish labour force.

1.13 The AAG projects relate more specifically to the latter two objectives.

REALIGNMENT

1.14 The introduction of Careers Scotland brought together 79 organisations. This in itself was a major exercise, particularly in reducing uncertainty among the staff in these organisations. In relation to the projects, Careers Scotland was placed in the position of dealing with a series of projects which were derived from individual and local partnership arrangements and integrating them with a service that needed to be nationally consistent.

1.15 There were specific issues relating to staff transfer, building capacity and recruitment, as well as issues relating to the loss of charitable status and the impact on resources. Because the bids also included partners outwith Careers Scotland, it was difficult to simply realign them with Careers Scotland objectives and many of the project profiles were fairly tightly defined. Careers Scotland were required to comply with these contracts with partners. The integration has not been easy, but Careers Scotland has been able to gradually bring the
projects fully into the service and agree exit strategies. Figure 1.1 illustrates this process simply.

**Figure 1.1: Integration of AAG projects and Careers Scotland**

1.16 In practice, the realignment of projects has primarily impacted on marketing. While the local partnership bids usually included some local promotion of the service, the introduction of a national service made this redundant. Instead, resources were used to support a national campaign and to develop other communication tools, including the advertising campaign, the web-site and other materials.

1.17 It is easy to overlook the fact that as this integration was taking place, Careers Scotland was required to maintain a high quality AAG service. Based on the data collected from the survey this was achieved.

1.18 In the Highlands and Islands, the same issues were relevant but there were also a number of differences. Originally, there were five partnership bids from the Highlands and Islands, but these were subsequently brought together into a single, pan-Highland, bid together with the delivery of the inclusiveness projects. Provision of adult guidance was well developed in some areas (Orkney) and in other places there was virtually no service (Skye and Lochalsh). ESF funding in the Highlands was also used to help support services and in some areas the projects did not necessarily add to the total funds available. To further complicate matters, the boundary between HIE and SE changed over this period with the inclusion of Moray and Argyll and Bute in the Highlands.

1.19 Bringing such a diverse range of services together for a single bid was extremely difficult, particularly as the issues for adult guidance can be different from those in the SE area. For example, in the Highlands, unemployment is not so much an issue as under and
more seasonal employment. In other cases people can have several jobs in a community and access to opportunity can be severely limited. The emphasis, through the project and subsequently Careers Scotland, has therefore been on developing skills awareness and career health checks to help individuals review their own skills.

1.20 The introduction of Careers Scotland changed the role of the partnership elements of the bids. The main focus has necessarily been on building capacity internally in Careers Scotland in order to deliver the service rather than the more complex partnership arrangements that were necessary under the original bids. Partnership remains crucial to the way that Careers Scotland delivers its objectives but this is a different structure to the one originally envisaged for the projects.

1.21 Generally, the role of Careers Scotland has been to balance the local interests embodied in the projects with its remit to deliver a national service and standards; a balance between ensuring consistency within a national strategy and the need to retain the local aspects of the projects that addressed specific local conditions. This has been done within a context of complex and changing management arrangements.

1.22 It is against this background of rapid change and considerable institutional reorganisation that the structure of the research and the results of the surveys must be set.

THE EVALUATION

1.23 The evaluation of the All Age Guidance projects began in late 2001, although the formation of Careers Scotland and its launch in April in 2002 significantly changed the methodology and shape of the work. It was originally intended to examine the progress of the projects as part of a series of local case studies, but the introduction of Careers Scotland and the realignment of the projects effectively meant that rather than a series of projects, there would now be a single service. This meant that there was little rationale for assessing the delivery of the projects locally. Instead, the research was restructured as a longitudinal study. It was agreed that this would involve two sets of telephone interviews with clients who had used the AAG service, followed by a programme of face to face interviews with a smaller number of participants approximately a year after their first contact with the service. In parallel, an omnibus survey across the Scottish population was also carried out to monitor changing perceptions of the need for careers information, guidance and advice and of Careers Scotland itself.

1.24 The research and the results reported here, therefore, take a national view of AAG and the impact that it has had on its clients. By using two sets of interviews with the same clients
we have been able to examine not only the short term impact of the support that they received, but also effects that occurred over the next nine months.

THE REPORT

1.25 This is the final report and follows an earlier interim report produced in August 2003. The interim report was based on the results from the first survey of AAG clients covering their experiences and outcomes and used performance monitoring data collected by HIE and SE. This report builds on these results and includes an analysis of the second survey carried out in late 2003. The main sources used in the analysis are:

• an initial telephone survey of 559 AAG participants carried out in February 2003

• a second telephone survey of 371 of the same participants carried six months later between July and September 2003

• a programme of 36 face to face interviews with a subset of these participants carried out March and April 2004

• the results of an omnibus survey carried out every six months from April 2002 to March 2004 to assess the extent to which Career Scotland is an organisation that is recognised among residents of Scotland

• consultations with Careers Scotland in HIE and SE and with four local offices

• performance monitoring data collected by HIE and SE.

1.26 The report has been kept relatively short with most of the analysis of the surveys and case studies contained in appendices.
CHAPTER TWO AAG OUTCOMES AND ADDITIONALITY

AAG OUTCOMES

2.1 The sources for this analysis are the two sets of telephone interviews with clients of the AAG service conducted in January/February 2003 (approximately three months after their first contact with Career Scotland) and then with the same clients in July/August 2003 (approximately six months after the first interview).

2.2 For this analysis we have used only the 362 cases that participated in both surveys. This ensures that we are comparing like with like and genuinely tracking the same group of individuals. Any changes between the baseline and follow-up surveys are genuine changes for this group of clients, and are not just a result of differences between the baseline and follow-up sample.

2.3 There remains an issue of whether these cases remain a representative sample of all the AAG cases reported in 2002/03, which we have used as the basis for grossing up the results. For example, was it that those that did not respond, or whose contacted details had changed between the two surveys shared particular characteristics? Having reviewed the data (see chapter 5) our view is that this is not the case and that the 362 cases remain as representative as the original sample.

2.4 There are two measures that allow us to assess progress over the period:

- the actions taken by clients (e.g. applying for jobs/courses)

- economic status (which can be compared with clients’ status when they first contacted Careers Scotland and at the time of their baseline interview)

ACTIONS TAKEN

2.5 Respondents to both surveys were asked what actions they had taken since we last interviewed them six months previously. The results are shown in Table 3.1 along with the proportion of baseline respondents who said they had taken such actions since first contacting Careers Scotland. Given that the baseline survey took place approximately three months after their first contact with Careers Scotland, these findings can be taken as roughly representing (a) actions taken in the first three months after contacting Careers Scotland and (b) actions taken 3-9 months after first contact.
2.6 The final column shows the total proportion of cases which have undertaken an action either in the first or second period, or both. It is not the sum of the first two columns as this would include those that had taken an action in each period, twice.

2.7 In the first three months we found that 33% of respondents had started a job/new job, but in the six months between the surveys, 50% reported starting a job or new job. This includes a small proportion that claimed to have started a job in both periods. This is certainly possible and the face to face interviews support the fact that clients will often take short-term work while continuing to look for other options. Overall, since first contact with Careers Scotland we estimate that 65% of participants started a job over the nine months. This implies that 18% claimed to have started a job in both periods.

2.8 After three months, 26% had started or completed a training course. Over the following six months a further 41% started or completed a training course. Over the full period, allowing for those that started several courses, 44% of all clients either started and/or completed a training or education course.

2.9 What is noticeable about these results is the extent to which individuals continued to take action and achieve outcomes after contact with Careers Scotland. Given that 90% of clients had not returned to Careers Scotland between our first and second interviews, the results suggest that participants, having received information, advice or guidance were now putting this into practice.
Table 2.1: Actions taken within 3 months, between 3 and nine months over the nine month period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Actions in taken from first contact to baseline survey (3 Months)</th>
<th>Actions taken since the baseline survey (3 - 9 months)</th>
<th>Total percentage of clients that have undertaken action since first contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Applied for a job</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started a job/new job</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for training and education courses</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started or completed a training or education course</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into sources of financial support</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found additional financial support</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into new childcare options</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made new or better care arrangements</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into other care options</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Done voluntary work</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had no outcome</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>2%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Base</strong></td>
<td><strong>368</strong></td>
<td><strong>368</strong></td>
<td><strong>368</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.10 Figure 2.1 shows the proportion of respondents who reported starting a job/new job since their baseline interview by economic status when they first contacted Careers Scotland. A high proportion of the respondents who were unemployed or facing redundancy when they approached Careers Scotland have now started a job/new job since the baseline survey.

---

4 NB In the follow-up survey respondents were asked separately about whether they had started an education or training course and whether they had completed an education or training course. Twenty-five per cent of respondents had started a training or education course since the baseline survey and 16% had completed one. Overall, 33% had either started or completed a course (or done both) since the baseline survey.

5 This figure is not the total that had reported no outcome in either wave one or wave two, but the proportion that had reported no outcome over the nine months.
CHANGE IN ECONOMIC STATUS

2.11 Another way to look at the outcomes is to track the percentage of clients by status at the three points over the nine months of the study.

- when they first contacted Careers when they first contacted Careers Scotland in August to October 2002
- when they were first interviewed (3 months)
- when they were interviewed for a second time in August to September (9 months)

Changes in Status

2.12 The results in figure 2.2 show the percentage in employment rising from 43% at first contact to 72% after nine months. The percentage unemployed, facing redundancy or unable to work has fallen from 50% to 16% and the percentage in training or education has risen from 8% to 20%. There is some evidence that the growth in the numbers in employment and training start to slow after the initial sharp increases generated within the first three months of the support.
2.13 Table 2.2 shows the change in the sample profile in a bit more detail. These changes are all very positive. The proportion in full time employment has risen from 30% to 46% while the proportion unemployed has fallen from 35% to 14%. There have been significant shifts in some of the other categories. Part time employment has increased from 12% to 21% and the number of full time parents or carers has fallen. Some of these changes no doubt hide a number of other more subtle shifts as, for example, some in training or education leave to find employment and are replaced in the statistics by others moving from unemployment. This partly explains why the proportion in education and training initially rises as the projects help clients to enrol on courses, but falls again after nine months when many of these courses have finished.

2.14 The data suggests that there has been a significant shift from unemployment, in some cases through education and training, into employment and that this shift has continued over the full nine month period of the work.
Table 2.2: Employment status when first contacted Careers Scotland, after 3 months and after 9 months

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status when first contacted CS</th>
<th>Status at time of baseline interview</th>
<th>Status at follow-up interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed full-time</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed part-time</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employed/other</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In voluntary work</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In training</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At university full-time</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At university part-time</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At college full-time</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At college part-time</td>
<td>*%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unable to work because of short-term illness</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanently sick or disabled</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facing redundancy</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time parent/carer</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At school</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base</td>
<td>368</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.15 These figures do not show some of the more subtle shifts between categories that have taken place. Table 2.3 shows the changes between broad categories. Among those that were unemployed (or facing redundancy), 61% were employed after nine months and 13% were in training or education. A quarter were still unemployed.

2.16 Three quarters of those that were employed when they first contacted Careers Scotland are still in some form of employment and 16% are now in training or education. Half of those in education or training are still in the same category. Among “others” which includes carers/parents and retired people, 43% had found work and 24% were in education or training.
### Table 2.3: What happens to the clients after nine months

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status at first contact</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>In education or training</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In education or training</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.17 One of the patterns that Table 2.3 shows is that those that started in education and training seem more likely to go on to do further learning or training courses, while those either unemployed or in employment are more likely to move directly to another job or stay in employment. It might suggest that those who have worked often need and prefer to be earning income and are less willing to consider education and training options than those that are already doing it. The evidence from the face to face interviews also supported the finding that for those already with an income found it difficult to consider moving into education or training courses without financial support.

Taking the evidence on actions and outcomes in the first section and the changing status results in the tables and charts above, it is clear that the large majority of clients have made positive changes in their careers over the nine month period. The extent to which this is the result of AAG support is examined later in this chapter.

### Longer Term Impact on Career Planning Skills

2.18 One of the objectives of Careers Scotland (and the AAG projects) is to support people in developing the skills they need to manage their own careers, whether these are practical skills like preparing a CV or more cognitive skills like knowing where to find information or increase confidence about making decisions about their career. The follow-up survey of AAG clients included a series of questions aimed at establishing whether clients feel more confident in relation to these skills than they did a year ago, how useful they perceive these skills to be, and to what extent any improvement in respondents’ career planning skills might be attributed to their contact with Careers Scotland.

2.19 It is important to bear in mind that these are responses about the effect of support between nine months and a year ago. To some extent it therefore reflects the longevity of the value of the support. Figure 2.3 shows the percentage reporting that they feel much more, or a bit more, confident than a year ago. These are shown under three headings; practical skills, information seeking skills and decision making skills. Across all three groups, between 25%
and 35% were much more confident. A similar percentage reported feeling a “bit more” confident, giving totals of between 50% and 80% feeling more confident overall.

2.20 The results for the practical skills are marginally lower than for the other two categories. This is important in relation to the skills and knowledge that clients believe help their employment prospects most. A high proportion (62%) believed that practical skills such as preparing CV’s would help “a lot” compared with 49% that considered information finding skills would help a lot.

2.21 The highest scores are in respect to decision making and this is supported by the face to face interviews and the importance and value that respondents placed on the opportunity to think through options with an impartial adviser.

Figure 2.3: Percentage reporting that they feel more or much more confident than a year ago in a range of practical, information seeking and decision making skills
AAG and Careers Scotland’s Role in Raising these Skills and Knowledge

2.22 Around 30% - 40% reported that Careers Scotland, through AAG had helped improve these career planning skills “a lot”. These figures were higher for employed respondents, where the support is more likely to have led to a job, than unemployed. There was also a close link between those who felt that their confidence or skills had developed “a lot” and those that reported that Careers Scotland had helped “a lot”. This points to a group of around a third who have made significant progress through the AAG support.

Distribution of Benefits

2.23 Finally in this section we highlight the extent to which the support has helped career development management among two specific groups. The Closing the Opportunity Gap targets refer to increasing employment among lone parents and ethnic minorities. In addition we have looked at the role that the support has had on people over 45 years old, a group that would traditionally not have had access to these type of services. Table 2.4 presents the results of a number of the questions relating to the role that AAG played in relation to developing skills and confidence for those over 45 and for single parents. There are too few cases to draw any conclusions on the views of ethnic minorities.

2.24 The results make some striking points:

- In most cases a higher proportion of women than men believe that the support has been beneficial in terms of raising skills and confidence. This extends to the influence of Careers Scotland. Half of all the women in the sample considered that contact with Careers Scotland had improved their knowledge about careers/training a lot.

- Single parents was one group for whom the support has made greatest impact on skills and confidence. Across most of these categories, their scores demonstrate that they have benefited disproportionately from the service.
Confidence in deciding to change your career has improved a lot
Confidence in deciding what jobs you are best suited for has improved a lot
Confidence in deciding what kind of education or training you need has increased a lot
Contact with Careers Scotland has improved confidence a lot in relation to planning your career?
Knowledge about finding information about careers has increased a lot
Knowledge about finding information about training and education has increased a lot
Contact with Careers Scotland has improved knowledge about careers/training a lot
Sample sizes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.4: Effects of support on specific groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence in deciding to change your career has improved a lot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence in deciding what jobs you are best suited for has improved a lot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence in deciding what kind of education or training you need has increased a lot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact with Careers Scotland has improved confidence a lot in relation to planning your career?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge about finding information about careers has increased a lot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge about finding information about training and education has increased a lot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact with Careers Scotland has improved knowledge about careers/training a lot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample sizes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EXTRAPOLATING RESULTS FOR THE FULL CLIENT BASE

2.25 The sample of 559 participants has been weighted to reflect the population of AAG clients as a whole. It is therefore possible to extrapolate from these results to provide an indication of the overall impact. The analysis of the population suggests that there were a total of 39,732 clients participating in the service over the 12 months to April 2003 (the year which this sample represents). Applying this figure to the outcome summary gives the estimates shown in Table 2.5.
## ATTRIBUTING OUTCOMES TO THE PROJECTS

2.26 The figures so far are estimates of the number of clients reporting specific outcomes and take no account of:

- the extent to which the support that has been received has influenced the behaviour of the client, and
- even if it has had a significant influence, we are interested in whether the same outcome could have been achieved through any previous support structure

### Influence of AAG Projects on Outcomes

2.27 The results in the previous section detail the changes in circumstance and the outcomes achieved among respondents since they first contact Careers Scotland or participated in the AAG projects, but the results do not provide any evidence as to whether the change in circumstances or outcomes is the result of the AAG support or other factors. This section considers the contribution that the AAG support has had on the reported outcomes. It is important to bear in mind that while these interventions are intended to influence behaviour, a successful intervention may well result in less contact with the service as individuals develop
the skills and confidence to make their own decisions. The influence of AAG on the development of skills and confidence that provide a basis for individuals to inform themselves and make more appropriate decisions in the future is considered in the second wave survey described at the end of this report.

2.28 Table 2.6 shows the extent to which the clients interviewed considered the AAG support to have influenced the achievement of outcomes. For example, where clients have started a job or new job, 33% thought that the support had a lot of influence and 33% a little influence. Overall, 66% thought that there had been some influence. The level of influence is high, particularly on the training and education outcomes, suggesting that the support is making a significant difference to decisions to access courses.

2.29 The percentage of cases where there has been some influence have been used to produce the figure in the final column, which estimates the number of clients whose outcomes have been affected by the support.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.6: Contribution of AAG support to reported outcomes over 9 months</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contribution of AAG (participants’ responses)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for a job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started a job/new job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for training and education courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started or completed a training or education course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into sources of financial support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found additional financial support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into new child care options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made new or better care arrangements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into other care options</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.30 The level of attribution recorded in the follow up survey is higher than it was in baseline survey. It could be that with the passage of time memory of the level of influence has become a bit blurred and that the survey itself has encouraged respondents to attribute more to AAG than they did last time. Equally, as clients have achieved more substantial outcomes over a longer period of time, they may be more willing, with hindsight, to attribute this to the support they received.
2.31 It is not clear which of these factors is dominant in the results. The main finding though is that at the very least perceptions of the influence and value of the support have remained high. With 90% of respondents receiving no additional support over the six months between the interviews, this indicates that support received has had a sustained effect. We have used the reported statistics to estimate the number of clients influenced in Figure 2.4. This, together with the greater number of actions undertaken, makes the overall results attributable to the projects considerably higher than was recorded in the interim report.

2.32 Figure 2.4 shows that there is a significant difference between the number of actions and outcomes that the projects influenced after three and nine months. Almost twice as many clients have started a job, and consider the AAG support to have influenced this, after nine months than did after three. The pattern is repeated across the other outcomes and reinforces the view that a significant part of the services’ influence and impact takes place a considerable time after the advice and guidance has been received.

Figure 2.4: Number of clients that the AAG service had some influence on by actions/outcomes for 3 and 9 months

![Figure 2.4: Number of clients that the AAG service had some influence on by actions/outcomes for 3 and 9 months](image)

AAG IMPACT ON CAREER CHOICES AND EMPLOYMENT PROSPECTS

2.33 Finally, in terms of impacts, both surveys demonstrated clearly that respondents believed that the service and the support they have had has helped them to make the best
possible choices (67%) and made them more open to options (73%). Equally positively, 95% of respondents disagreed that they had been pushed into something they did not want to do and 91% disagreed that the support has had a negative impact on their decisions.

2.34 Overall 29% of clients believed that the support from Careers Scotland through the AAG service had improved their employment prospects “a lot” and 41% “a little” giving a total of 70%. This further confirms the findings that clients believe that the service has made a difference (Figure 2.5).

Figure 2.5: Percentage of clients who considered the information, advice and guidance received through the AAG service had helped employment prospects

When applied to the full population of AAG clients over the first full year of the projects, it is apparent that the projects have made a significant contribution to supporting clients in finding appropriate jobs, training and other forms of support. We estimate that 17,000 AAG clients that start a job and 13,000 that started or completed a training course were influenced by the projects. These numbers grew significantly over the six months between the first and second interviews.

ADDITIONALITY AND COUNTERFACTUAL CLAIMANT DATA

2.35 Additionality is the extent to which these outcomes might have been achieved without the AAG projects, presumably under the previous adult guidance structure. It is acknowledged by all the stakeholders that the measurement of adult guidance provision and its outputs has, in the past, been extremely limited. The Duffner report comments that,
“throughout the evidence we heard, reference was made to an inability to compare performance across companies”

2.36 With no clear indication of the scale, scope or quality of the services delivered previously it is difficult to make an accurate assessment of the changes that have taken place. To provide some measure of the level of service available prior to the introduction of the AAG projects we have reviewed what was then described as the current provision in the original partnership bid documents. A table containing this review is presented in Annex 4. This has necessarily been fairly broad brush, but it highlights the considerable variability of provision. Each area is categorised as good, fair, limited or very limited. It should be borne in mind that even where the service is described as fair, there are likely to be significant issues related to the quality, consistency and cohesiveness of provision.

2.37 The analysis suggests that overall, provision was patchy. In several areas there was a stronger more coherent delivery, for example in Orkney and Central, while in other areas there was virtually no support beyond New Deal Gateway. In most there was some basic guidance, but this was usually fragmented, offering services restricted to specific groups or geographies.

2.38 The level of additionality will, therefore, vary by area. The discussions in both Tayside and Edinburgh shed some light on this. In Tayside for example, the projects introduced some entirely new approaches and also worked with new target groups. Almost all of the clients that participated are likely to be additional, with the exception of those that might otherwise have used the New Directions initiative in Dundee. In Edinburgh, there was already a relatively strong partnership structure in place delivering an adult guidance service and developing a helpline. The project allowed this service to develop its technology more rapidly and to target rural communities and excluded groups. To assess additionality more accurately it would be necessary to look closely at the scale and quality of provision available in each local area in order to compare it with the situation now.

2.39 Much of the additionality generated by these projects relates to changes in quality and the range of resources and information available. This is enhanced by the increasing skills and capacity that the projects have helped to build up. Although some participants may have been able to access services under the previous structure, it is less likely that the support would have been as effective. As the Careers Scotland service has developed, building resources and structures, it is likely that the level of additionality through quality has risen.
2.40 Further evidence of the counterfactual is the responses of clients that have used other services in the past (37%). The results indicate that the AAG service represents a qualitative improvement on other services (39% thought that the AAG service was much better and 14% a bit better, while 9% thought it worse than alternatives they had used). This conclusion is supported by the satisfaction scores in the survey. It is not possible to draw a direct comparison between satisfaction with the AAG service and what went before and we should bear in mind that some of the comparators that respondents recall will be many years ago. However, in the light of the review of previous provision and anecdotal information the scores are sufficiently high to suggest that there has been a major increase in the quality of the service delivered. The satisfaction scores can be used as a baseline for future monitoring.

2.41 Clearly the lack of any baseline on the scale or quality of service prior to the introduction of AAG makes it difficult to assess the counterfactual case. Based on the evidence that we have, from the survey and an assessment of what was previously in place, we believe that the projects have added substantially to the scale and quality of provision. Where there was little or no service, the AAG service is wholly additional. Where a service already existed, the projects have targeted groups that were not participating in the previous service and so most of this activity would be additional. More generally, the additional resources (particularly staff) have allowed many more clients to participate than could have been the case before.

2.42 Finally, the step increase in activity in the final quarter of last year (see Chapter two) suggests that many of the clients participating have been stimulated to do so by the promotion of Careers Scotland. Again this would indicate that these clients are additional.

**Counterfactual claimant data**

2.43 A comparator that sheds some light on these outcomes is the unemployment claimant count. In Scotland in March 2002 there were 108,580 people registered as claimants. Of these, 32,045 had been claiming benefit for over six months. On average therefore around 30% of claimants remain registered as unemployed for more than six months while 70% would leave the register, usually when they found employment, within this period. While Careers Scotland’s role is not to place people in jobs, it is useful to bear in mind that when we look at the change of status among AAG clients, it is to be expected that a proportion will shift from unemployment into employment. This highlights the importance of recognising that the AAG projects have been about providing a much broader range of skills, allowing individuals to find appropriate training, education and careers. In this regard the results that
point to increased confidence and, as shown in chapter four, helping to make the best decision become more important as indicators of additionality.

Overall, there is sufficient evidence to conclude that without the AAG service there would have been limited alternative support for clients. Secondly, there is strong evidence that clients consider the support they received to have contributed significantly to the achievement of outcomes. Finally, the additionality of the service does not just relate to the reported outcomes, but to the quality of these outcomes and the development of wider set of skills. The satisfaction scores and comparison with previous services is very positive, but we should bear in mind that for many clients, previous experience of careers support services will have been many years ago.
CHAPTER THREE PERCEPTIONS OF CAREERS GUIDANCE AND AWARENESS OF CAREERS SCOTLAND

3.1 The Scottish Opinion Survey is an omnibus survey carried out each month by TNS (formerly NFO Worldgroup). Computer Assisted Personal Interviews are carried out with around 1,000 people each month, with quotas set on sex, age and working status to ensure that the sample is representative of the adult population of Scotland. Three questions were included in the Opinion Surveys every six months over the period of the research. The questions were included in March 2002, October 2002, April 2003, October 2003 and finally April 2004. The aim of these questions was to measure changes in perceptions of advice and career guidance and to monitor the changing profile of Careers Scotland as it established itself.

3.2 Question 1 (Figure 3.1) asked how useful or not people would find advice or guidance about careers, about training or about learning opportunities. The data suggests that people generally have become more willing to consider the value of guidance or careers advice and in terms of improving the levels of skills and knowledge.

3.3 Over the period of the study there has been a gradual increase in the proportion that would find this type of support very useful, rising from 12% in March 2002 to over 21% in April 2004. Equally, the proportion that reported that it would be not useful at all has fallen from 36% to 20%.

3.4 These are significant shifts over the two years, but the changes reflect wider economic conditions as well as the work of Careers Scotland. With what has been a sustained period of high employment, it may be that employees in particular become less concerned about simply finding or holding a job and more about whether it is the right job. In a tighter labour market people would also be more confident of finding employment if they were to leave their current employment to go to university or college or to retrain.
WHERE WOULD PEOPLE GO FOR ADVICE

3.5 The second question in the omnibus survey asked about where people would go for advice or guidance about careers, training or learning opportunities (Figure 3.2). From April 2003 we have sought to distinguish between those that respond specifically with Careers Scotland and those that suggest careers guidance or careers centres but do not mention Careers Scotland. In practice, many of those mentioning careers centres will now be referring to Careers Scotland facilities.

3.6 Over the period of the research the ranking of sources remains consistent. The job centre was the most cited source of support in March 2002 and over the two years the percentage has grown, from 25% to 33%. College and learning institutions was also high but has fallen from 25% to 17%. In April 2003, following an advertising campaign Careers Scotland was recorded as a separate category from other career services. Eight percent gave Careers Scotland as the main potential source of advice and guidance. This has remained at about this level over the following year.
WHAT DO PEOPLE KNOW ABOUT THE SUPPORT AVAILABLE?

3.7 Question three asked how much respondents knew about the services available from a range of different organisations. The organisations were read out in random order in an attempt to minimise any bias resulting from the order in which the organisations were presented to respondents.

3.8 These questions have been used in each of the six omnibus surveys and allow us to monitor the profile of each organisation over the two years. The pattern is fairly consistent. Awareness and knowledge of both Careers Scotland and Learndirect have increased.
markedly over the last two years while awareness of the other organisations, has remained broadly steady. The data is set out graphically in the charts in Annex 2.

3.9 In Figure 3.3, knowledge about Learndirect Scotland can be seen to have risen sharply over the two years. The proportion that know a little about it has doubled from 18% to 36%, thanks no doubt to the advertising campaigns. The figures for Careers Scotland show a similar pattern, but started from virtually no awareness at all prior to its launch in April 2002. The group that know a little has more than doubled, from 9% to 25% over the two years.

3.10 The Scottish Learning Centre was introduced into the monitoring as a “dummy” to see how the data fluctuated over time and whether there were some respondents who would claim to know of organisations whether or not they really did. It is reassuring that the percentage of those that claimed to know about the fictitious centre remained very steady. However, a third of the Scottish adult population claimed to have at least heard of it. It suggests that there is some confusion in the minds of the public between the various organisations.

3.11 The Job Centre and local colleges and learning institutes are well established and people largely feel that they know a lot or a fair amount about them. This level of knowledge remained steady throughout the period of the study. At the other end of the scale the Scottish University for Industry has remained largely unrecognised by the public.

3.12 Figure 3.3 brings together the percentages of people who have heard of the organisations over the two years. The results show three pairs. The main changes over the period have been the sharp rises in awareness of both Career Scotland and Learndirect. Awareness of Careers Scotland has grown from 37% to 76% and is now close to the level of recognition of the Job Centre and local colleges/learning institutes. SUfI and the fictitious Scottish Learning Centre both show much lower levels of recognition.
CONCLUSIONS ON AWARENESS

3.13 The omnibus survey has been able to track changes in awareness of careers advice and guidance and knowledge of Careers Scotland over 12 months. The results for both are very positive. There are two major conclusions from the work:

- the percentage of people who would find advice or guidance about careers, about training or about other learning opportunities very useful rose from 12% to 21% between March 2002 and April 2004. This is just over a fifth of the adult population.

- the percentage that have heard of Careers Scotland has risen from 37% to 76% of the population between March 2002 and April 2003. This compares with 85% who have heard of Learndirect Scotland and 80% who have heard of the Job Centres. The percentage that know a little about Careers Scotland has risen from 9% to 25% and those that know a fair amount has risen from 3% to 10%. The advertising campaign is no doubt responsible for the step increase in awareness between October 2002 and April 2003.
Within two years Careers Scotland has played a major part in raising awareness of advice or guidance about careers. While a high proportion of people are now aware of its existence, the data also suggests that most people would still approach the Job Centre or local colleges/learning institutions for careers advice and guidance. Having successfully raised awareness of the name, the results suggest that the next stage is to increase the public’s knowledge of the services that it provides.
CHAPTER FOUR   DELIVERY OF AND SATISFACTION WITH THE SERVICE

INTRODUCTION

4.1 This chapter of the report summarises the main findings from the survey on the delivery and satisfaction of the AAG services. A fuller analysis is presented in Annex 2.

CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SAMPLE

4.2 The profiles of both the baseline and follow up surveys were very similar which suggests that there was little systematic bias in the non-responses to the follow up survey. There were slightly more women (52%) than men (48%) in the baseline survey (54% and 46% in the follow up survey). In the baseline survey 63% of clients were under 35 compared with 53% in the follow up survey six months later. The monitoring data from Careers Scotland indicated that for all participants, 60% were under 35.

4.3 Figure 4.1 shows the profile of clients in the sample by socio-economic groups. These figures are set against the national Scottish profile. The graph shows that between the baseline and the follow up surveys there is a fairly significant decrease in the percentage in DE and an increaser in the percentage in C2. This shift is explained almost entirely by the number of clients that have moved out of unemployment in C2 category jobs (mainly non-manual, lower skilled jobs). It is not because a larger proportion of DE’s were able or willing to take part in the follow up survey. In fact the proportion of baseline respondents falling into the DE category was very similar between those who did and did not take part (see Annexes for more detail).

4.4 In the interim report we drew attention to the high proportion of DE clients that the service was dealing with as an indication of the services engagement with more disadvantaged groups. The data from the follow survey shows how, over nine months, the service has impacted on this group.
**HOUSEHOLD TYPE**

4.5 Table 4.1 shows the household type of participants in the baseline and follow-up surveys as well as comparable figures for Scottish non-pensioner households, where possible/appropriate. A higher proportion of respondents to the follow-up survey compared with respondents to the baseline are part of a couple with children. The Scottish figures were calculated on the basis of data from the Scottish Household Survey 2001-2002 and show the follow up survey in particular as having a similar profile.
Table 4.1: Household type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Type</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Follow-up</th>
<th>Scotland (excluding pensioner households)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single person</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple, no children</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>n/a6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single parent</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple with child(ren)</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing a household with parents/relatives</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>n/a7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing a household with other adults</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some other kind of household</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>*8</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Base</strong></td>
<td>559</td>
<td>371</td>
<td><strong>21,121</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ETHNICITY

4.6 Ninety six percent of respondents were white, while 4% were from ethnic minorities (1% Asian, Scottish Asian or British Asian, 2% were Black, Black Scottish or Black British and 1% were from other ethnic groups). Based on the 2001 census, 2% of the Scottish population is from non-white ethnic groups. It indicates that representation of ethnic minorities is slightly higher in the sample and among Careers Scotland clients than in the country as a whole.

Status at the time of first contact

- 54% of clients were in paid employment, either full time, facing redundancy, self employed or part-time
- 39% were unemployed

---

6 NB The “small adult” category in the Scottish Household Survey includes any household containing two adults of non-pensioner age and no children. Strictly speaking, this is not directly comparable with the “Couple, no children” category used in the All Age Guidance Surveys, since the small adult household need not necessarily be a couple. Twenty-five per cent of non-pensioner households fall in to the “small adult category”.

7 Again, there is no category in the SHS that is directly comparable to these categories. However, 14% of non-pensioner households in Scotland as a whole are “large adult households” (households containing three or more adults and no children).

8 * indicates a proportion smaller than 1%.
• 12% were in training or education full or part-time

4.7 Those employed full time were most likely to be between 25 and 34 years-old. Differences between the proportion of respondents in different age groups who were unemployed are not statistically significant.

BACKGROUND AND MOTIVATIONS

4.8 The most common motivation for contacting Careers Scotland was to change job or career (34%) and a further 10% wanted to find a better job. Slightly fewer (27%) were seeking employment. Eighteen per cent wanted to improve their qualifications or skills and 8% wanted to find out about specific courses. Table 4.7 shows the results. There was little difference in the motivations between men and women.

Services and support

• the majority of clients (78%) contacted Careers Scotland to discuss possible career options or career planning
• 63% made contact to get information in person
• 20% requested information by telephone
• smaller proportions visited to make use of the library or computer facilities or accessing the services via the internet
• there was no significant difference in the types of contact by gender.

4.9 The questionnaire distinguished between access and use of information services and advice and guidance services. A high proportion of respondents used both.

Information

• information on careers ideas and planning was received by three quarters of respondents
• those who were in training or education when they first contacted Careers Scotland were more likely than those in employment to request information on careers planning and choices
• among those that were in work or employed, there were high proportions receiving information on re-training and education and financial support.
• the high percentages in each category suggest that most clients received information on a number of different subject areas.

**Satisfaction with information**

4.10 Satisfaction with the delivery of information as part of the service is very high (see Annex 3). Overall around 60% of clients are very satisfied and a further 30% quite satisfied with how clear/easy it was to understand the information and with how easy the information was to get. Although still very high, scores for the relevance and usefulness of the information were marginally lower.

**Advice and Guidance**

4.11 The provision of advice and guidance follows a similar pattern to the provision of information with a large proportion of discussions covering both career planning and education and training options:

- 79% of clients received advice on career choices
- 70% received advice and guidance on training and education options (including 62% considering retraining)
- 34% received advice on preparing CVs
- 39% were provided with details of other agencies to contact
- 20% received training in interview techniques

4.12 Contact has largely been through face to face meetings either in the Careers Scotland office (79%) or elsewhere (19%). Telephone contact represents 17% of contact and groups 4%. E-mail and web access represented 13% of contact.

**Satisfaction with provision of advice and guidance**

4.13 Satisfaction with the advice and guidance provided was similar to the scores recorded for the provision of information (Annex 1). Approximately 90% are very or quite satisfied, with only a small number (1% - 4%) dissatisfied. Scores are uniformly high for ease of understanding, arranging meetings and the advisor’s understanding of the client’s position. In the small number of dissatisfied cases, the complaints included problems of having to arrange meetings within working hours, difficulties getting appointments and the advice being too general.
Overall satisfaction with Careers Scotland service by AAG clients

4.14 Overall, the satisfaction scores for the service are very positive reflecting the previous sections on information and advice and guidance provision (Table 4.2). The pattern of satisfaction is the same with high scores for most aspects of the service. Privacy, the clarity of explanations, speed of service and availability of staff generally are considered to very or quite satisfactory by 90% or more of clients. To some extent these figures are also a reflection of the expectations of clients, and as the service develops the figures will not necessarily rise. In some cases clients may become more sophisticated and critical users of the service over time. Careers Scotland should aim to maintain these average scores over the longer term.

| Table 4.2: Overall satisfaction with services (responses only for applicable aspects) |
| Mean score based on very satisfied =2 to very dissatisfied = -2 |
| Base = 559 |
| Mean score | Very satisfied | Satisfied | Neither | Quite dissatisfied | Very dissatisfied | Don’t know |
| The level of privacy | +1.7 | 74 | 19 | 3 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| The ability of staff to explain things clearly | +1.6 | 65 | 27 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 0 |
| The availability of staff | +1.5 | 59 | 32 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 4 |
| The speed of the service | +1.4 | 57 | 33 | 6 | 3 | 1 | 4 |
| Transport access to the Careers Scotland centre from your home | +1.4 | 57 | 25 | 9 | 3 | 1 | 6 |
| The opening hours | +1.4 | 51 | 28 | 5 | 3 | 1 | 12 |
| The level of encouragement and support from the staff | +1.4 | 58 | 27 | 8 | 3 | 3 | 1 |
| How much staff knew about careers options | +1.3 | 51 | 33 | 7 | 3 | 3 | 4 |
| The availability of computers | +1.3 | 48 | 26 | 8 | 4 | 2 | 0 |

4.15 Particular strengths of the services and suggested areas for improvement reported in the survey are set out in more detail in Annex 1. The strengths of the service include:

- Friendly/helpful/patient/understanding staff
- Helped to think in different ways/consider options had not thought of before
- Convenience/Ease of contact
- Advice on/details of other people/orgs to contact
• Encouragement/boost to confidence
• Help with interview techniques/practice interviews
• Just being able to talk to someone/get advice
• Comprehensiveness/amount of info available from Careers Scotland
• Offer of ongoing support

4.16 The areas for improvement tended to relate to issues around resources such as more staff, more time with staff, more computers etc. There were also several comments about extending outreach services and accessibility, but these were limited to one or two clients.

Contact details
4.17 Virtually all respondents (93%) had spent time with a Careers Scotland advisor. A third had used a computer and just less than one in ten had been part of a group. Of those who have had contact with staff in person, just over half (55%) had only had one meeting. A quarter had met the advisor twice and 20% three or more times.

Use of information and guidance
• 27% of the sample have used or had fully taken on board all the information and guidance provided
• 47% have used or taken on board some of it
• 7% reported that they would not use the information or advice they received.

4.18 Overall, this is a positive picture, particularly given the relatively short time since that clients have been in contact with Careers Scotland. A large majority have taken on board or used the information provided.

4.19 Among the small number (7%) that did not intend to use the information or advice received or had not decided whether to use it yet, the main reasons were a lack of relevance or usefulness (35%), changes in circumstance or future plans (16%), or that they were still exploring their options or were still undecided (12%).

Use of other services and comparisons
4.20 In total, 37% of the sample had utilised other services in the past two years for information, advice and guidance about careers, training or employment.
• the most cited examples were the job centre (20%) and careers services in universities (17%)

• the AAG service was considered to be better than other services that had been used. For 53% it was much better or a bit better and no different for 38%.

FURTHER CONTACT WITH CAREERS SCOTLAND

4.21 Of the sample interviewed in the follow up survey, 90% had not returned to Careers Scotland in the six months from the first interview. Most had not returned because they had achieved a positive outcome– found a job or started a training or education course (60%). Eighteen percent now felt that they now had all the information they needed, while around 16% had either changed their mind about a new career or their personal circumstances had changed. Only 2% were dissatisfied with the service (Figure 4.2).

Figure 4.2: Reasons for not returning to Careers Scotland in last six months

4.22 The results show that the relationship with Careers Scotland is usually over a fairly short period and that this is because clients either achieve a positive outcome or feel that they now have the skills that they need to make decisions rather than any dissatisfaction with the.
SATISFACTION WITH RECENT CONTACT (FOLLOW UP SURVEY)

4.23 Among the 10% of respondents who had been in contact with Careers Scotland since their baseline interview, the majority were either “very satisfied” or “quite satisfied” with the aspects of the Careers Scotland All Age Guidance service.

4.24 In the follow up survey it was also interesting to assess whether those that had returned to use the service more recently noticed any difference or improvement. A quarter of respondents who had been in contact with Careers Scotland since the baseline survey rated their more recent experience of the service as either “a lot” or “a bit” better than the service they received when they first contacted Careers Scotland. Reasons for assessing their recent contact more highly were:

- that they had been encouraged to call back for more help
- that the advisor had been better or more knowledgeable
- that there had been more computers available, and
- that the respondent had had a better idea of what they wanted so had been able to get more help.

The characteristics of the original sample are considered to be representative of the population of AAG clients over the period April 2002/03. Within the sample almost half of the clients were in socio-economic group DE, reflecting the high number of unemployed people (39% of clients were unemployed). Over the nine months of the study, the socio-economic profile has shifted as clients have moved into employment, chiefly into the C1 group. The sample is almost evenly split between women and men and is a close match by age to the monitoring data collected by Careers Scotland.

One of the key findings of the research is the level of satisfaction. This is uniformly high across all aspects of the service. If anything, the follow up survey suggests that more recent experiences have been even better, although the sample that used it more recently is small.

The relationship with Careers Scotland is usually over a fairly short period and this is because clients either achieve a positive outcome or feel that they now have the skills that they need to make decisions rather than any dissatisfaction with the service.
CHAPTER FIVE  FACE TO FACE INTERVIEWS

FACE TO FACE INTERVIEWS

5.1 As part of the second wave of telephone interviews, participants were asked whether they would be willing to take part in a final face to face interview. From the database of those that had agreed, letters were sent out to a sample of 190. The letters were followed up by telephone and interviews were arranged in locations around Scotland.

5.2 In total, 50 interviews at appointed times were arranged with participants. Careers Scotland centres were used for the majority of the interviews in Inverness, Glasgow, Irvine, Falkirk, Glenrothes and Aberdeen. In some cases, interviews also took place in local hotels or in the interviewee’s home. In Edinburgh, interviews were conducted at SQW’s offices. Despite financial compensation and reimbursement of expenses for attending interviews, there was a relatively high proportion of potential interviewees that did not turn up. In Glasgow, only 3 out of ten attended the interviews.

5.3 In order to boost the number, we contacted participants in the Borders and Stornoway to set up interviews and also followed up other Edinburgh participants in the evenings. This brought the total up to 37 face to face interviews. Table 5.1 shows the numbers arranged and achieved for each area, town or city.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5.1: Interview locations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arranged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glasgow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayrshire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aberdeen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edinburgh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inverness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glenrothes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Falkirk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stornoway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MOTIVATION FOR USING THE SERVICE

5.4 Although the motivations for contacting Careers Scotland and using the AAG services were wide ranging, in all cases contact was triggered by a decision point of some kind. This
included redundancy, unemployment or a desire to create life or work changes. In the cases where the participant was employed it was usually the result of under-employment or dissatisfaction with their current career, or lack of one. The need for change, whether imposed or self-imposed, prompted individuals to seek assistance and support in looking at alternative career options, course information and job search skills.

5.5 There were some differences related to location. In Stornoway for example, participants felt more restricted in the type of employment opportunities that were available locally. The necessary training often required moving, at least for a short time, to the mainland. There were examples, primarily in more rural locations, where interviewees felt that the options being discussed with the adviser were not realistic to their geographical area.

5.6 In the majority of cases individuals did not approach Careers Scotland initially but were referred though other agencies such as Community Education Departments, Colleges, the Job Centre and other employment and enterprise support initiatives including PACE. In the main, individuals were not aware that Careers Scotland offered a service to adults and even those who had heard of Careers Scotland thought the service was for young people. The need to advertise more effectively to the older age group was a common comment. Finding out about the AAG service was of course much more difficult at the time when they first used it.

**Emma**

Having been a teacher for 20 years, Emma was looking for a change of career and contacted Careers Scotland to assess her options. She used to be a careers’ officer herself and so was aware that the service existed. She had an initial chat by telephone in November 2002 before returning to use a computer package to help assess her options. The results were then sent to her and a follow up call was promised, which never came. While the computer programme was helpful, Emma felt that the support offered was ‘focussed on an ideal world’.

Suggestions were not linked to the realities of living in the rural locality where there were limited opportunities. Instead, they tried to help her find her ideal career rather than a match with vacancies and local opportunities. Emma is now working part time for the Citizens’ Advice Bureau and is very happy, but is not convinced that she has found her niche. She would like to be promoted to bureau manager and work full time and is doing training to improve her promotion chances. Careers Scotland’s computerised package suggested the voluntary sector work and encouraged Emma to think more widely. She has encouraged other people to use the computerised package since.
than it would be now as national advertising has made a significant change to the level of awareness (See chapter 4).

5.7 Many of the participants had visited the Job Centre at some point before Careers Scotland. The remit of the two is very different and interviewees commented on the different approaches. They felt that it was one of the strengths of Careers Scotland that advisers seemed to be genuinely interested in them, that they did not feel rushed and were able to explain their background and ideas. One interviewee also felt that Careers Scotland had been better than the University Careers Service that she had used previously.

Jenny

Jenny left school with 5 Highers and went on to take a Biotechnology course at college. She left the course after deciding that this was not the correct career path for her. She found work at a local supermarket but after six years decided it was time to look for an alternative career and she was referred to Careers Scotland by her local Community Education department. Three interviews followed, which took place in a local school as access to the nearest Careers Scotland Centre was difficult. Each interview lasted 2-3 hours and covered various activities including: a personality test that provided her with a variety of options to consider; discussion on the most appropriate career choice; information on course provision and; some assistance in creating a CV. Jenny was delighted that there was no limit to the time offered to assist her in making the right decision.

Through the guidance process Jenny decided to aim for a career in Primary school teaching and was ready to begin when she became pregnant. She has consequently decided to wait until her child is older before embarking on the full training. In the meantime she is undertaking short courses related to Primary teaching to keep her mind active. She is currently taking open learning courses in psychology, child oriented care and learning through play.

Jenny feels that with the help of Careers Scotland she has regained her confidence and has a much clearer career goal to aim for. She was particularly impressed with the friendly and approachable manner of the Careers Adviser and the quality of guidance and information offered, particularly as the service is free.

5.8 It was apparent that only a small number, perhaps a quarter, had specific ideas about what they wanted. Most were looking for a career change generally and needed more in depth guidance and support to help them to make an informed choice about their future career direction e.g. one client switched from teaching to establishing her own retail fashion business and another sought any kind of employment that would allow him to spend time looking after his mother who was ill.
5.9 In most cases, clients would have a fairly general idea about areas of interest, but these were usually poorly defined e.g. an interest in teaching, social work, going to sea, tourism or nursing. It was not unusual for interviewees to say that they had “no idea” about what they wanted to do beyond the fact that they wanted to do something different from their current position.

**ACTIVITIES**

5.10 In the majority of cases the services and support offered varied depending on the needs of each individual. Those requiring information and advice received a one-off interview and were provided with the information they required on the career area they were interested in. This was provided through discussion, handouts, information on the internet and they were provided with contact names, addresses and telephone numbers and web-sites to enable them to follow up the information provided.

5.11 Beyond this, the range of services offered to those requiring more in depth guidance was provided over a period of several weeks and involved 2-5 interviews. Importantly for clients, this support was designed to meet the needs of the individual and the stage they were at in determining their future career path. Interventions included computer based career tests, discussion on career opportunities and relevant training provision, the provision of information, job search activities including CV, letter and application form preparation and guidance on job interviews. Several clients we interviewed were given business start up advice and were referred to Business Gateway (as well as Enterprising Women) in the SE area and one to the HIE starts programme in the Highlands and Islands.

5.12 In addition to the practical assistance offered, it was reported that through the support offered individuals felt more motivated, encouraged and given the confidence that they needed to proceed with the next steps on their own.

5.13 In the case of a mass redundancy the experience was quite different. An event was organised on site at the workplace and involved various agencies such as the Job Centre, Colleges other employers and Careers Scotland offering one-to-one interviews. In all but one case employees were allocated around 15-20 minutes with each of the agencies attending. Careers Scotland provided information on college courses and job search advice although the service individuals reported varied. Due to the short time allocated to most individuals the service provided was considered to have been limited.
SATISFACTION

5.14 All of the clients interviewed, with the exception of those in the mass redundancy situation, were very satisfied with the support they received. The process they were taken through in coming to a career decision was thought to be very effective as it took account of their individual situation and needs. The information provided was relevant and clients were provided with appropriate means of following up on the decisions they came to in the guidance process.

5.15 There were several areas for improvement. In two cases, both where more specialist guidance and information was sought, the interviewees were more critical. There were also comments to the effect that resources had seemed to be stretched and it had taken time to get an appointment. Another interviewee felt that there was too little privacy in the areas used for interviewing.

John

John left school with little idea as to his career options. He was interested in finding employment or in engaging in further training and was working in the hotel sector. He contacted Step Ahead (Aberdeen’s career service) prior to contacting Careers Scotland in 2001.

He had several sessions with Careers Scotland and support included information provision, advice and guidance. He was supporting in developing his CV and was provided with lists of recruitment agencies. Feedback from these agencies revealed that without qualifications his prospects were limited. John is now in year 2 of an HND in accounting at Aberdeen College which he read about in the local paper.

John is full of praise for Careers Scotland. He felt that they provided practical help which enabled him to progress at a time when he was unclear as to his options. John is about to complete his diploma and he could go on to University and get into third year accountancy but is more likely to join an accountancy firm and work towards his chartered accountancy exams. He feels that his career options are now clear and that he will not need to contact Careers Scotland again.

5.16 The experience of those in the mass redundancy situation was somewhat different as in the majority of cases they did not feel that the service met their needs and in fact felt let down. Individuals were at a crisis point and did not believe that a short interview provided them with the time to discuss potential career opportunities or time to explore different methods of job search. The focus tended to be on college courses rather than on job
opportunities available locally and methods of accessing these. Recommendations from these clients included:

- the need to provide longer interviews to explore in more depth career options and possibilities.

- it would have been helpful if people had been given a form to complete prior to interview asking basic questions like qualifications, experience, interests and the interview could then have focussed on the needs of the individual – in depth guidance or information.

- more advice on job search/internet recruitment sites and how to access them/recruitment agencies would be helpful.

**FOLLOW UP**

5.17 The majority that we interviewed had taken action to follow up the recommendations of the adviser. In some cases this may have only been to get more information, but participants generally had made efforts to explore the options suggested. In the cases where this was not done, other opportunities had usually come up or personal circumstances had changed. Where the expected outcomes had not been achieved, it was usually not because they were not followed up, but because of changing circumstances.

**Benefits**

5.18 Perhaps the most often reported benefit was the opportunity to take the time and speak to a careers professional who would listen. It was an opportunity for them to think through their longer term goals and get an impartial opinion. It might be termed a guided environment. Several interviewees commented that they could not get this non-judgemental type of support from friends or family, or indeed anywhere else.

“While there was nothing specific, I received some excellent moral support in a dreadful situation. I left with a less negative feeling about my situation. They pointed out that I wasn’t alone, that my situation was not uncommon and they encouraged me to be realistic and to look at my options”

5.19 The main benefits reported included:

- encouragement in re-evaluating the skills individuals did have and recognising what they already had to offer.
• confidence and opened minds to think about what was available and consider options not considered before.

• confidence and greater assertiveness to take action on what was discussed and to access opportunities.

• confidence to pursue career goal and the information to do this

• enhanced self esteem that has also led to improved team working skills

• through referral by Careers Scotland to Business Gateway new business skills have been acquired

5.20 There were also benefits through improvements to CVs. In one case, a client had approached Careers Scotland solely to get advice on refining a CV for a specific job. Most of the interviewees felt that improvements to their CVs had been among the most practical and helpful support received.

5.21 There was plenty of evidence that the advisers had listened to clients and provided plenty for options for the participants to follow up. There were interviewees who reported that even if it could not be claimed that Careers Scotland had impacted directly on career outcomes, it had provided them with a space in which to seriously consider their future.

OUTCOMES

5.22 The wider telephone surveys provide a measure of the change in status of those participating in the research. It does not show whether these outcomes were those that the individual had originally identified. The face to face interviews provide some insight into this.

5.23 The majority of interviewees were now in employment including self employment, some form of training, undertaking voluntary work or in several cases, on maternity leave. In one case, the client was about to launch her new business (May 2004). It was noticeable how few cases there were where nothing had changed and there were very few cases where individuals remained unemployed. This in part reflects the length of time since their contact with Careers Scotland. Having said that, there were also many examples where these changes or outcomes were very different from those discussed with the careers adviser.
5.24 Although the advice and guidance was usually followed up by the individual, over a longer period of time, it is apparent the many other factors start to influence career decisions. There is no doubt that these case studies bring home the reality of career and job searching. In the period since we first interviewed them, events in the interviewees’ lives have regularly changed. While we might expect that after Careers Scotland advice is followed up, participants would continue to successfully find appropriate training or work in the area identified, in fact, in many of the cases circumstances changed and other outcomes followed.

5.25 Participants often identified and followed up opportunities quite different from those that they originally expressed interest in. One man, who had been investigating teaching qualifications, followed up a flyer that came through his door and now works for a national charity. Several others found voluntary work. One found work as a 999 ambulance dispatcher after looking for offshore oil-related work. It was not unusual to find that child commitments have impacted on decisions. Family and other personal circumstances changed frequently, throwing up new options completely unrelated to those that were being followed up as a result of the guidance.

5.26 The examples where the client had visited Careers Scotland, identified an area of interest, followed up and then found related training or employment seemed to be in the minority. Instead, plans and actions, or inactions, took place within a constantly changing
environment. This is to be expected and reinforces the role that AAG and Careers Scotland play in developing career development skills rather than mapping out specific career plans.

INFLUENCE OF CAREERS SCOTLAND

5.27 It was apparent from the interviews that much of the influence of the service is indirect and complex. Although individuals may have chosen to follow up something unrelated to the suggestions of the careers adviser, there may well be a link between the support and discussion that they had and their willingness to take on other offers. Several of the interviewees believed that the discussions that they had, while not directly leading to a new direction, helped them to understand their strengths and interests and when other opportunities came up they felt more confident about taking them.

Julie

Julie wanted information on how to get on a course as a mature student in order to train to be a primary school teacher. After finding the details of Careers Scotland in the phone book she had a personal interview to explore the different options for training to be a teacher. During this meeting the adviser called different educational institutions to look at grants and entrance requirements. As a result of this search, it was recommended that Julie do an access course. She then followed up on the interview with a number of phone calls to her adviser to talk through her financial options and the adviser helped her to locate bursaries for single parents.

Julie found that the advice was invaluable as it put her on the right road. She did not have to wait too long for an appointment and Careers Scotland was flexible in fitting the appointment around her childcare needs. Julie continues to work as a registered child minder and is currently finishing her access course and has a place booked on a teacher training course in the future. Eventually Julie would now like to be an educational psychologist.

Careers Scotland provided a key role as Julie wouldn’t have known how to find the relevant access courses or funding and wouldn’t have had the confidence to make the necessary calls to different colleges herself. Careers Scotland provided her with confirmation that she was following the right path and this made her feel more confident in her decision to retrain. Julie would definitely contact Careers Scotland again if she needed advice or help.

5.28 The key areas of influence were:
• Encouragement, motivation and giving them the confidence to reach their current position – one client said that Careers Scotland believed in her and that this helped her to get the two interviews she wanted

• Without Careers Scotland it would have been very difficult to see a clear career path ahead. Careers Scotland thus acted as a catalyst to help to reach decisions about which options to follow.

• Assistance was also given in understanding and re-evaluating current skills and competences, which helped to give confidence to interviewees.

• Information issued was easy to access and further points of contact issued made it straightforward to follow up on the advice given.

5.29 Those interviewed about their experience of support through the mass redundancy felt that Careers Scotland had a much more limited influence and that they had progressed through their own efforts and by using other agencies such as Job Centre Plus and recruitment agencies.

James

James had spent 30 years working in industry, the last twelve of which were in senior management, before he was made redundant. He consequently applied for many different posts, at lower levels and also in different industries, but was unsuccessful. This made him very frustrated. He consequently decided to look for work in a different sector and contacted Careers Scotland after finding their details through a web search. He had two meetings with them in June and July 2002.

In the first meeting he used a computer package to develop a profile and a list of potential career options, including nursing. In the second interview, James completed the profile and the adviser called a college to make an appointment to talk through applying for an access course in nursing. He also received guidance on updating his CV to make it more appealing to the current job market.

After his visits to Careers Scotland, James applied to a University and was accepted on the nursing course. He is now six months into the course and is finding it to be very rewarding.

In the future, James would like to manage an NHS service, using his management skills to complement his current career choice. He would definitely use Careers’ Scotland again if he wanted to look for a different career option.

James feels that Careers Scotland provided invaluable support after his redundancy through offering a fresh perspective and a list of options that he had never considered.
LONG LASTING BENEFITS

5.30 There is evidence from the interviews that in the cases where in depth careers guidance was given, changes have been longer lasting. These range from greater experience and knowledge in job searching, refinement of CVs or interviewing to one individual who believes that it has had a life-changing effect. In this case personal/family problems had been a barrier to the client’s progression in work but the support provided by Careers Scotland had led to the realisation that she could not allow those barriers to be too much of an influence on her life and work.

5.31 Even where the individuals were unable to attribute their change of status or where there had been no definitive outcome from their involvement with the service, most believed that it had given them time and the environment within which to consider how they might develop their career. This in itself was considered a useful and long lasting benefit, even where other events meant that the ideas were not followed up.

5.32 The process of thinking through options, and in most cases following them up, provided confidence and that they could change their working lives. The technical skills of where to look for information, who to contact and how to present a CV were all raised by interviewees as aspects of job and training searching that they felt more confident in.
## CONCLUSIONS

The key points are:

- the wide variety in cases and the constantly changing circumstances of those that used the service.
- motivations were driven by impending unemployment, unemployment, under-employment and dissatisfaction with a current job.
- in nearly all the cases there were positive changes in status over the period
- these outcomes were often very different from original plans. Often these are a matter of chance. This reinforces the role of the adviser in developing more generic career development skills.
- despite the major changes that occurred in the interviewees’ lives since their first contact with Careers Scotland and changes in plans, nearly all interviewees believed that the AAG service had positively influenced their career decisions
- throughout, there was a high level of satisfaction with the quality of the service.

Without doubt, a year on from the first interview, the majority of the participants are now in a better position or engaged in a more satisfying career. These are positive outcomes both for the economy (as participants have found jobs or are training for jobs which better reflect their strengths) and for participants personally. Importantly, the case studies demonstrate the unpredictability of career development. In most cases the outcome varied substantially from what had been envisaged when they first visited Careers Scotland. In whatever way their careers developed, there was a consensus on the value of a “guided environment” within which to explore options and build confidence.
ANNEX 1 SURVEY RESULTS – WAVE 1

METHODOLOGY AND CHANGES

1.1 Our original approach to the evaluation of the AAG projects was set out in a proposal accepted by the Scottish Executive in late 2001. Over the last eighteen months there have been a number of changes in response to the interests of the steering group, principally in relation to the launch of Careers Scotland in April 2002. The introduction of Careers Scotland and its role as a national service greatly reduced the need to examine the delivery of the projects at a local level. As the projects became increasingly integrated into Careers Scotland’s mainstream delivery, it became more difficult to differentiate between participants in the AAG projects and those related to the mainstream work of Careers Scotland. This continues to be an issue for the evaluation and for the steering group.

1.2 Originally it was intended that the AAG projects would be part of a series of case studies to examine the ways in which the partnerships were operating and their success or otherwise. A major element of this was to collect monitoring data from each of the local partnership projects. This was to be supported by two separate surveys of participants together with a national omnibus survey of awareness of adult guidance services in order to present a national picture.

1.3 Once Careers Scotland was operational, it was agreed that there was little merit in undertaking the analysis at a project or local level as Careers Scotland would introduce a greater degree of consistency to the project delivery and monitoring. It was agreed that rather than collect performance data from the local projects, data would be provided directly by Careers Scotland. The focus of this evaluation would be on the outcomes of the projects and their sustainability at a national level. It was also agreed that rather than undertake two separate surveys, resources should be used to undertake a follow up survey of the original sample to test the sustainability and whether:

1.4 the choices made by clients as a result of receiving all age guidance were, in retrospect, appropriate ones for the clients concerned

1.5 the services have equipped clients with the sort of training, education and career management skills likely to be of long-term value.
SURVEY METHODOLOGY

1.6 This section of the annex presents the main findings from the survey of users of the All Age Guidance (AAG) services. The survey was conducted between mid-November 2002 and early February 2003 by NFO Social Research. The results have been weighted to reflect the profile of service users and provide a detailed baseline covering:

- characteristics of respondents
- background and motivations
- services and support
- level of use
- benefits and impact
- comparisons.

Sample

1.7 NFO Social Research conducted telephone interviews with 559 Careers Scotland All-Age guidance clients between mid November 2002 and early February 2003. These individuals were recruited to the study from across Scotland by Careers Scotland staff over a two-month period from late August to late October 2002. Staff were asked to recruit all all-age guidance clients with whom they had contact during this period. Information on the research, including guidance on recruiting clients for staff, information for clients, and client consent forms, was cascaded to all staff that had contact with clients by the local All Age Guidance managers. Interviews were staggered, so that individuals were contacted approximately three months after they were recruited to the study.

1.8 A total of 1,035 names and phone numbers were collected, of which 61 were incorrect numbers or duplicates. The eventual sample size was therefore 974. Interviews were achieved with 596 respondents, indicating a response rate of 61%. However, of these 596 respondents, 37 were aged 16 or 17 years-old. As All Age Guidance money is intended to be targeted on adults aged 18 or over, the decision was taken to exclude these respondents from the data for analysis.

Weighting

1.9 Weighting was used to try and counter any response bias in the sample resulting from differential recruitment or participation in different areas. Using monitoring data from
Careers Scotland, the profile of respondents in the data was matched to the actual profile of All-Age Guidance service users in different areas of Scotland. The weights were based on a combination of the age group respondents fell into, and the area of the Careers Scotland office they had visited.

1.10 For the Scottish Enterprise area, the weights are based on monitoring data on the age of All-Age guidance clients across the 12 SEN areas for September and October 2002 (the months in which recruitment for the study took place). For the HIE area, monitoring data was only available by quarter, so the figures for the third quarter of 2002 (October to December) were used to calculate weights. The fact that recruitment took place over two, rather than three months was taken into account in calculating the HIE weights from the monitoring data.

Characteristics of respondents

1.11 The survey captured details of a range of the clients’ characteristics, at the time of their first contact with Careers Scotland and at the time of the interview. This section sets out details of people who have engaged with the projects.

1.12 Table A.1 shows the weighted proportion of male and female clients in the sample. These proportions match the Scottish population profile.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1.1: % of male and female respondents in the sample</th>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>Scotland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unweighted base</td>
<td>559</td>
<td>Population</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.13 Figure 4.1 shows the time elapsed between the interview and the respondent’s first contact with the Careers Scotland. More than half had first contacted Careers Scotland in the previous three months and 90% within the previous six months.
1.14 In terms of the socio-economic profile, the AAG services were used by higher proportions of DE and C1 groups relative to the adult population as a whole (Table A.2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1.2: % in socio-economic groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unweighted base</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.15 Table 1.3 sets out the sample structure by household type. Relative to the Scottish working age population, the sample shows higher than average proportions of:

- single people
- part of a couple with no children
- single parents

⁹ Based on 2003 National Readership Survey.
Table 1.3: % of sample by household structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total sample</th>
<th>Scotland¹⁰</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single person</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part of a couple with no children</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single parent</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part of a couple with child</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing household with parents or relatives</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing household with other adults</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some other kind of household</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td><strong>256</strong></td>
<td><strong>303</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.16 The average age of the sample is lower than the Scottish average. Seventy nine percent of men and 87% of women are under 45 in the sample compared with the Scottish population, of which 60% are under 45.

Table 1.4: % of sample by age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Scotland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18 – 24</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 – 34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 – 44</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 – 59</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 – 64</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td><strong>256</strong></td>
<td><strong>303</strong></td>
<td><strong>Population</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.17 The AAG activities served people from a range of circumstances. Twenty nine percent were employed full time and 12% part time. Twelve percent faced redundancy and 39% were unemployed when they first contacted the service. In total 12% were in education or training. Those employed full time were most likely to be between 25 and 34 years-old. Differences between the proportion of respondents in different age groups who were unemployed are not statistically significant.

¹⁰ Scottish Household Survey, 2001 (adjusted to reflect working age households).
1.18 Of those in training when they first contacted Careers Scotland, the majority were undertaking degree or higher degree courses. However, the numbers engaged in education or training are very small in relation to the sample size (Table 1.6).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Base: all those training</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HNC</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HND</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher degree</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCQF Level 6 or below</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td><strong>13</strong></td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**BACKGROUND AND MOTIVATIONS**

1.19 The most common motivation for contacting Careers Scotland was to change job or career (34%) and a further 10% wanted to find a better job. Slightly fewer (27%) were
seeking employment. Eighteen per cent wanted to improve their qualifications or skills and 8% wanted to find out about specific courses. Table 1.7 shows the results. There was little difference in the motivations between men and women.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thinking of changing jobs/career</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To find employment</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To improve qualifications/skills</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To find a better job</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was facing redundancy</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To find out about specific courses</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interested in learning generally</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To find out about options generally/to find out about different career/training options</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interested in a specific subject</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To improve current earnings/career status</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To help return to work after a period of absence (e.g. looking after a family)</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td>559</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.20 The ways in which clients first heard of Careers Scotland were varied, perhaps unsurprisingly given the short time that the organisation had been up and running and the limited marketing carried out by December 2002. Most contacts were through referrals from other organisations or education institutes. In the Highlands and Islands, schools, colleges and universities played a larger role. In the SE area, more people had heard of Careers Scotland through their employer (Table 1.8).
Table 1.8: How respondents first heard about Careers Scotland, by area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>HIE</th>
<th>SE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Suggested by another organisation (Council or other)</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From school, college or university</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From a friend or colleague</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From my employer</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saw a leaflet, poster, or other advertisement</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From another careers advice provider</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through Job Centre</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passing by the Careers Scotland centre/office</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From a teacher or parent</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article in a newspaper, magazine, television or radio</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search on the internet</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td>559</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>577</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SERVICES AND SUPPORT

1.21 Respondents were asked about the type of contact they had with Careers Scotland. The majority (78%) had contacted Careers Scotland to discuss possible career options or career planning, while 63% had contacted them to get information in person. Around a fifth of contact has been by telephone with smaller proportions visiting to make use of the library or computer facilities or accessing the services via the internet. There is no gender difference in the types of contact experienced (Table 1.9).

Table 1.9: Which, if any, of the following describes the contact you have had since April 2001? Has it been…..

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>..to discuss possible career options or career planning</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>..to get information in person (leaflets, lists or guides e.g. on courses)</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>..to get advice about how to use the services on offer</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>..to request information by telephone</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>..to use a computer or library facility</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>..to request information by the Web</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td>559</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.22 The questionnaire distinguished between access and use of information services and advice and guidance services. A high proportion of respondents received both.
1.23 Information on careers ideas and planning was received by three quarters of respondents. Those who were in training or education when they first contacted Careers Scotland were more likely than those in employment to have received information on careers planning and choices. Among those that were in work or employed, there were high proportions receiving information on re-training and education and financial support (Table A.10). The high percentages in each category suggest that most clients received information on a number of different subject areas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Base = all who received information</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>In other education/training</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Facing redundancy</th>
<th>FT carer</th>
<th>Other economically inactive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Career ideas/planning</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career choices</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information about specific careers</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training or education options</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Options for retraining</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Details of other agencies to contact</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance for training or education</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support for childcare</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unweighted base</td>
<td>517</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Satisfaction with information**

1.24 Table 1.11 sets out the average satisfaction scores for a number of aspects of the provision of information. Overall around 60% of clients are very satisfied and a further 30% quite satisfied with how clear/easy it was to understand the information and with how easy the information was to get. The level of dissatisfaction is relatively low. Scores were slightly lower for the relevance and usefulness of the information. Among the small number that
were dissatisfied, the reasons were typically that the material was too general, that the advisor did not understand their circumstances or that they felt pushed in a certain direction. Although clearly satisfaction overall is very high, these findings suggest that the ability to tailor information to individual needs is an issue that Careers Scotland may wish to consider in the future.

Table 1.11: Satisfaction with provision of information
Mean score based on very satisfied =2 to very dissatisfied = -2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Base = 517</th>
<th>Mean score</th>
<th>Very satisfied</th>
<th>Satisfied</th>
<th>Neither</th>
<th>Quite dissatisfied</th>
<th>Very dissatisfied</th>
<th>Don't know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How clear/easy it was to understand the information</td>
<td>+1.5</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How easy it was to get information</td>
<td>+1.5</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How relevant the information was to your needs</td>
<td>+1.3</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How helpful the information was, overall</td>
<td>+1.3</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ADVICE AND GUIDANCE

1.25 The provision of advice and guidance follows a similar pattern to the provision of information. The high percentages in each category suggest that each client received advice and guidance on a number of different topics. For example, 79% received advice on career choices and 70% on training and education. Many discussions clearly covered both areas. A third were provided with advice on preparing CVs and a relatively high proportion 39% were given contact details of other organisations. A fifth were given advice or guidance on interview skills (Table 1.12).
Table 1.12: Type of advice and guidance received by employment status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possible career ideas or choices</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>In other education/ training</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Facing redundancy</th>
<th>FT carer</th>
<th>Other economically inactive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Face to face meetings</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone contact</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other economic inactive</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possible career ideas or choices</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Details of other agencies to contact</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparing CVs</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance for training or</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting for childcare</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitments</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unweighted base</td>
<td>517</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Delivery of advice and guidance

1.26 Contact has largely been through face to face meetings either in the Careers Scotland office (79%) or elsewhere (19%). The higher proportion of meetings outside the Careers Scotland offices in the SE area perhaps reflects the larger number of redundancy cases that have been handled in the first six months. Telephone contact represents 17% of contact and groups 4%. E-mail and web access represented 13% of contact (Table 1.13).
Table 1.13: Which, if any, of the following describes the contact you have had since April 2001? Has it been.....

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contact Description</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>HIE</th>
<th>SEN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Face to face meetings with advisor or guidance staff in the office</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Face to face meetings with advisor or guidance staff somewhere else</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By telephone</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using a computer at the Careers Scotland centre</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through e-mail or web-site at home/other internet access</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As part of a group</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Unweighted base 517 78 439

Satisfaction with provision of advice and guidance

1.27 Satisfaction with the advice and guidance provided was similar to the scores recorded for the provision of information. Approximately 90% are very or quite satisfied, with only a small number dissatisfied (Table 1.14). Scores for the ease of understanding, arranging meetings and the advisor’s understanding of the client’s position, are uniformly high, but the relevance of advice scores are slightly lower with several more respondents dissatisfied and significantly fewer ‘very satisfied’. Their complaints included problems of having to arrange meetings within working hours, difficulties getting appointments and the advice being too general.

Table 1.14: Satisfaction with provision of advice and guidance
Mean score based on very satisfied = 2 to very dissatisfied = -2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How clear/easy to understand the advice or guidance given to you was</th>
<th>Mean score</th>
<th>Very satisfied</th>
<th>Satisfied</th>
<th>Neither</th>
<th>Quite dissatisfied</th>
<th>Very dissatisfied</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+1.6</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How easily meetings could be arranged</td>
<td>+1.6</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The advisor's understanding of your position</td>
<td>+1.5</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How relevant the advice/ guidance was to your needs</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 517
Overall satisfaction with Careers Scotland service by AAG clients

1.28 Overall, the satisfaction scores for the service are very positive reflecting the previous sections on information and advice and guidance provision. The pattern of satisfaction is the same with high scores for most aspects of the service. Privacy, the clarity of explanations, speed of service and availability of staff generally are considered to very or quite satisfactory by 90% or more of clients (Table 1.15). There are slightly lower scores for access to computers and the knowledge of advisors. To some extent these figures are also a reflection of the expectations of clients, and as the service develops the figures will not necessarily rise. In some cases clients may become more sophisticated and critical users of the service over time. Careers Scotland should aim to maintain these average scores over the longer term.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1.15: Overall satisfaction with services (responses only for applicable aspects)</th>
<th>Mean score based on very satisfied = 2 to very dissatisfied = -2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Base = 559</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The level of privacy</td>
<td>+1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability of staff to explain things clearly</td>
<td>+1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The availability of staff</td>
<td>+1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The speed of the service</td>
<td>+1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport access to the Careers Scotland centre from your home</td>
<td>+1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The opening hours</td>
<td>+1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The level of encouragement and support from the staff</td>
<td>+1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How much staff knew about careers options</td>
<td>+1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The availability of computers</td>
<td>+1.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.29 Particular strengths of the services and suggested areas for improvement reported in the survey are set out in Table 1.16. The strengths of the service cover a full array of the aims of Careers Scotland, while clients reported some specific aspects for improvement.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Areas for improvement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Friendly/helpful/patient/understanding staff</td>
<td>Improve relevance to individual situation/needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helped to think in different ways/consider options had not thought of before</td>
<td>More information on specific careers/subjects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of knowledge/Computer/web facilities</td>
<td>Length of time it takes to get an appointment too long</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Useful info/advice on training/education generally</td>
<td>More publicity/making more people aware it's available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with CV</td>
<td>Improvements to physical accessibility - e.g. more outreach, better location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Face to face/one-to-one contact</td>
<td>More/better aftercare/ follow-up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convenience/Ease of contact</td>
<td>Longer/later opening hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advice on/details of other people/orgs to contact</td>
<td>More/better information on FE/HE and courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being shown/talking through different options</td>
<td>Need more time with staff/need more staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouragement/boost to confidence</td>
<td>Need more financial information/advice (e.g. claiming benefits, grants, tuition fees, loans)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with interview techniques/practice interviews</td>
<td>Make (more) computers available for clients to use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just being able to talk to someone/get advice</td>
<td>Need to provide a better service to older people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help/guidance in finding a direction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensiveness/amount of info available from Careers Scotland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having information to take away and read at home</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offer of ongoing support</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with planning/ knowing what to do next</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Contact details**

1.30 Clients were asked to provide details of their contacts and the time spent with careers advisors in the first six months of the service. Of those who have had contact with staff in person (n = 535), just over half (55%) had only had one meeting. A quarter had met the advisor twice and 20% three or more times (Table 1.18). Given that many of the respondents had contacted Careers Scotland relatively recently, the relatively low number of contacts is unsurprising and would be expected to increase over the next period.
Table 1.17: Number of times had contact with Careers Scotland staff in person since April 1st 2002

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Base = All those who have had face-to-face contact with Careers Scotland staff</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Once</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twice</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three or four times</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 10 times</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 10 times</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t remember</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.31 Seventy two percent of the sample had also had contact with Careers Scotland other than in person since April 1st 2002. Of these, 35% could recall one contact and 40% more than one contact not made in person (Table 1.18).

Table 1.18: Number of times had contact with Careers Scotland NOT in person since April 1st 2002

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Base = All those who have had non face-to-face contact with Careers Scotland staff</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Once</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twice</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three or four times</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 10 times</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 10 times</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t remember</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Type of contact

1.32 Virtually all respondents (93%) had spent time with a Careers Scotland advisor. A third had used a computer and just under one in ten had been part of a group (Figure 1.2).
Duration of contact

1.33 The total time that clients reported spending with a Careers Scotland advisor, using computers and in groups is shown in Table 1.19. For almost half of the respondents the total time spent with an advisor was less than an hour, reflecting the typically small number of meetings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total time with advisor</th>
<th>Total time with computer</th>
<th>Total time in groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than 30 minutes</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 minutes to under 1 hour</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2 hours</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-4 hours</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-10 hours</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 10 hours</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t know/can’t remember</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td><strong>531</strong></td>
<td><strong>155</strong></td>
<td><strong>52</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Use of information and guidance

1.34 Although we have profiled the form of information and guidance delivered, it is useful to investigate the extent to which it has been taken on board by clients. Table 1.20 sets
out the level to which the information and guidance has been used. More than a quarter of the sample have used or have fully taken on board all the information and guidance provided. Approximately half have used or taken on board some of it, and 7% reported that they would not use the information or advice they received. Overall, this is a positive picture, particularly given the relatively short time since that clients have been in contact with Careers Scotland. A large majority have taken on board or used the information provided.

Table 1.20: The level to which the information and guidance from Careers Scotland has been taken on board

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>You have used some of it or taken some of it on board</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have used all of the information or taken the advice or guidance fully on board</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You have not used any of it yet but are likely to use it</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You do not intend to use it</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You have not used it yet and have not decided whether to use it or not or</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Didn't get any info/not applicable</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information not new/ reinforced previous information</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don't know/not sure</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unweighted base</td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.35 Among the small number that did not intend to use the information or advice received or had not decided whether to use it yet, the main reasons were a lack of relevance or usefulness (35%), changes in circumstance or future plans (16%), and that they were still exploring their options or were still undecided (12%).

USE OF OTHER SERVICES AND COMPARISONS

1.36 In total, 37% of the sample had utilised other services in the past two years for information, advice and guidance about careers, training or employment. The percentages are shown in Table 1.27. The most cited examples were the job centre and careers services in universities.
Table 1.27: Other sources of information, advice and guidance used

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job Centre</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The university careers service</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An employers organisation</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The local authority</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The college careers service</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Local Enterprise Company (LEC)</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment agencies/ recruitment consultancies</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleges/universities generally</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Website</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn Direct</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private/voluntary careers advice organisations (e.g. Springboard</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland, Wise Group</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Gateway</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A school Careers Guidance teacher</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t Know/Can’t remember</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.37 Overall, the Careers Scotland service was considered to be better than other services that had been used. For 39% it was much better and for 14% it was a bit better (Table 1.28).

Table 1.28: Comparison of Careers Scotland with other organisations offering career guidance services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comparison</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Careers Scotland service is/was much better</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers Scotland service is/was bit better</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is no difference</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers Scotland service was a bit worse</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers Scotland service is/was much worse</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unweighted base</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
OUTCOMES AND ADDITIONALITY

1.38 This second section of the analysis focuses specifically on the outcomes generated by the AAG projects, assesses their additionality and uses the monitoring data reported in Chapter three to provide estimates of outcomes for the population.

1.39 Although it is fairly early on in the process and many of the respondents have only been in contact with Careers Scotland for less than three months, the survey has collected data on a series of outcomes. These reflect the actions that clients have taken since their first contact with Careers Scotland, but do not take into account whether or not the support has played a part in achieving these outcomes. Table 1.29 contains the reported outcomes cross tabulated by the status of clients when they first made contact. The main findings are that:

- 66% have applied for a job and 31% have started a new job
- 42% have applied for training or education courses and 24% have started a course
- 23% have looked into financial support and 10% have been successful
- 8% reported none of these, but had achieved a range of softer outcomes.
- Among those that were unemployed, 78% applied for a job and 36% have started a new job.

1.40 Based on the sample the following outcomes have been achieved

- 178 respondents have started jobs and 127 have started training courses
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>In other education/training</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Facing redundancy</th>
<th>FT carer</th>
<th>Other economically inactive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Started a job/new job</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for a job</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for training and education courses</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started or completed a training or education course</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into sources of financial support</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found additional financial support</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into new child care options</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into other care options</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made new or better care arrangements</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taken some action/had an outcome, but not related to contact with Careers Scotland</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had no outcome yet</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td>559</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>258</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.41 Outcomes can be cross-tabulated with the time of the first contact with Careers Scotland. This provides some evidence that stronger outcomes are the result of more time with spent with Careers Scotland. For example, those who have been in contact for 12 months or more are more likely to have applied for a job than those who have been in contact for less than 6 months. A greater proportion of those that have worked through the AAG activities for 12 months or more have started a job than those that have spent less time. (Figure 1.3).
Figure 1.3: Outcomes cross-tabulated by length of time since initial contact

- 0-3 months before interview date
- 3-6 months earlier
- 6-12 months
- More than 12 months

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event</th>
<th>0-3 months</th>
<th>3-6 months</th>
<th>6-12 months</th>
<th>More than 12 months</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Applied for a job</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for training and</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started a job/new job</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started or completed a training or education course</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into sources of financial support</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found additional</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had no outcome yet</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into new child</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made new or better care arrangements</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into other care options</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taken some action/had an outcome, but not related to</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>contact with CS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.42 Another way of looking at the changes in the respondents’ circumstances is to consider their employment status at the point of their first contact with an AAG initiative, and again at the time of the interview. Table 1.30 shows the change in the numbers in the sample. These changes are generally very positive. The proportion in full time employment has risen from 29% to 38% while the proportion unemployed has fallen. There have been minor changes in some of the remaining categories although these are probably hidden as, for example, some in training or education leave to find employment and are replaced in the statistics by others moving from unemployment. Overall, the data suggests that there is a general shift from unemployment, in some cases through education and training, into employment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment status when first contacted Careers Scotland</th>
<th>Employment status now</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed full-time</td>
<td>29% 38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>39% 29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed part-time</td>
<td>12% 19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent/carer</td>
<td>10% 12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In training</td>
<td>2% 9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In voluntary work</td>
<td>2% 4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At university full-time</td>
<td>3% 4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At college part-time</td>
<td>- 4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At college full-time</td>
<td>1% 2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At university part-time</td>
<td>1% 2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unable to work because of short-term illness or injury</td>
<td>2% 2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At school</td>
<td>4% 1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>- 1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>- 2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.43 Table 1.30: Employment status when first contacted Careers Scotland and present employment status

1.43 Figure 1.4 shows the changing status of participants from non-school education, employment, unemployment and those facing redundancy. The numbers given refer to the full client base.
Figure 1.4

Clients in other (non-school) education: 3,245

Clients employed:
- Employed full-time: 9,446
- Employed part-time: 4,471
- Unemployed: 1,731
- Parent/carer: 2,235
- In training: 721
- In voluntary work: 793

Clients unemployed:
- Unemployed: 15,359
- Employed full-time: 4,038
- Employed part-time: 1,875
- Parent/carer: 361
- In training: 2,091
- In voluntary work: 505

Clients facing redundancy:
- Unemployed: 4,831
- Parent/carer: 361
- In training: 288
- In voluntary work: 577

Clients in employment: 16,513

Clients in other education: 1,659

Clients in other (non-school) education: 1,154

Clients unemployed: 1,231

Clients facing redundancy: 1,238

Clients in voluntary work: 1,231
TRAINING BENEFITS

1.44 One of the aims of the survey was to understand how participants expected the training or education experiences to impact on their skills and employability. The results of the survey show that generally those in training are considerably more optimistic about its potential impact than those that have completed training and are now in, or looking for, employment.

- 73% expected training and education to help a lot in finding a job. 35% who had completed a course or training thought that it had actually helped a lot, and 14% a little.

- While 72% expected the training and education that they were participating in would improve their chances of getting a job a lot, among those already in employment 33% thought that it would help a lot in gaining promotion.

1.45 Although we would anticipate higher expectations of training among those that are undertaking it (otherwise why would they be doing it), the fact that almost half of those that had completed a training or education course found that the course had helped either a lot (35%) or little (14%) is an indication of that these activities are impacting positively on individuals chances of finding employment.

Table 1.31: Expectations and experiences of training and education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expect training or education course to help get a job</th>
<th>How much did training or education course help you get a job</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A lot</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A little</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not much</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t know/can’t say</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found a job before completed course</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td><strong>93</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.46 Expectations of training were lower in terms of improving promotion prospects than in helping to secure a job or other employment (Table 1.32).
Table 1.32: How much would you say the training/education received might help you to……

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BASE :</th>
<th>…gain promotion in you current workplace? (All those who have remained in employment and who have taken part in training or education)</th>
<th>…your chances of getting another/a job? (All those who have taken part in training or education)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A lot</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A little</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not much</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unweighted base</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NO OUTCOMES

1.47 For those that reported no outcomes, the survey collected data on a series of softer outcomes to reflect progress towards employability. These included the impact of the AAG support on finding employment, finding courses, increasing confidence, information about the job market and awareness of childcare options. The results are shown in Table 1.33. Generally, the results suggest that their contact with Careers Scotland has had a positive impact for at least some of this group. Fifty-three per cent of this group reported that they thought their chances of finding an appropriate course had improved ‘a lot’ or ‘a little’ as a result of the information, advice and guidance received. Fifty per cent thought their confidence had improved ‘a lot’ or ‘a little’, and 47% thought it had made them better informed about the job market. A lower proportion (34%) said they thought their chances of finding employment had improved.
EXTRAPOLATING RESULTS FOR THE FULL CLIENT BASE

1.48 The sample of 559 participants has been weighted to reflect the population of AAG clients as a whole. It is therefore possible to extrapolate from these results to provide an indication of the overall impact. The analysis of the population in chapter two suggests that there have been a total of 39,732 clients participating in the service over the 12 months to April 2003. Applying this figure to the outcome summary gives the estimates shown in Table 1.34.

**Table 1.33: Impact of AAG support on a range of softer indicators**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BASE: All those who have had no outcome yet or an “Other” outcome</th>
<th>Improved your chances of finding employment</th>
<th>Improved your chances of finding appropriate courses</th>
<th>Increased your confidence</th>
<th>Made you more informed about the job market</th>
<th>Made you more aware of childcare options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A lot</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A little</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not much</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average score</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unweighted base</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 1.34: Outcomes for the sample and population**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% in sample</th>
<th>Total in sample</th>
<th>Total in population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Started a job/new job</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for a job</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for training and education courses</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started or completed a training or education course</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into sources of financial support</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found additional financial support</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into new child care options</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into other care options</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made new or better care arrangements</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taken some action/had an outcome, but not related to contact with Careers Scotland</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had no outcome yet</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unweighted base</strong></td>
<td><strong>559</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.49 Of the 39,732 clients participating in AAG projects over the year:

- 26,223 have applied for a job and 12,317 started a new job
- 16,687 have applied for a training or education course and 9,536 started or completed one
- 3,973 found financial support
- 1,192 made new or better care arrangements
- 4,371 did not report any of the above, but had achieved softer outcomes. Of these:
  - 1,486 felt the support had improved their chances of finding employment
  - 2,317 thought it had improved their chances of finding appropriate courses
  - 2,186 thought it had increased their confidence
  - 2,054 claimed it had made them more informed about the job market.
ATTRIBUTING OUTCOMES TO THE PROJECTS

1.50 The figures so far are estimates of the number of clients reporting specific outcomes and take no account of:

- the extent to which the support that has been received has influenced the behaviour of the client, and
- even if it has had a significant influence, we are interested in whether the same outcome could have been achieved through any previous support structure.

1.51 These are addressed in the following sections.

Influence of AAG projects on outcomes

1.52 The results in the previous section detail the changes in circumstance and the outcomes achieved among respondents since they first contact Careers Scotland or participated in the AAG projects, but the results do not provide any evidence as to whether the change in circumstances or outcomes is the result of the AAG support or other factors. This section considers the contribution that the AAG support has had on the reported outcomes. It is important to bear in mind that while these interventions are intended to influence behaviour, a successful intervention may well result in less contact with the service as individuals develop the skills and confidence to make their own decisions. The influence of AAG on the development of skills and confidence that provide a basis for individuals to inform themselves and make more appropriate decisions in the future is considered in the second wave survey described at the end of this report.

1.53 Table 1.35 shows the extent to which the clients interviewed considered the AAG support to have influenced the achievement of outcomes. For example, where clients have started a job or new job, 29% thought that the support had a lot of influence and 22% a little influence. Overall, 58% thought that there had been some influence. The level of influence is fairly high, particularly on the training and education outcomes, suggesting that the support is making a significant difference to decisions to access courses.

1.54 The percentage of cases where there has been some influence has been used to produce the figure in the final column, which estimates the number of clients whose outcomes have been effected by the support.
Table 1.35: Contribution of AAG support to reported outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contribution of AAG (participants responses)</th>
<th>A lot</th>
<th>A little</th>
<th>Not much</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Estimate of client base (some influence)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Started a job/new job</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>7,144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for a job</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>17,831</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for training and education courses</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>13,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started or completed a training or education course</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>7,629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into sources of financial support</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>6,031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found additional financial support</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>2,225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into new child care options</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>1,080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into other care options</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made new or better care arrangements</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>632</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.55 On this basis, we can make a more refined assessment of the influence of the AAG service on outcomes. We can say that the projects had some influence on:

- 58% of those starting a job/new job – 7,144
- 68% of those applying for a job – 17,831
- 80% of those starting or completing a training or education course – 7,628
- 83% on those applying for a training or education course – 13,850
- 56% of those finding additional financial support – 2,225
- 53% of those making new or better care arrangements - 632
1.56 Additionality is the extent to which these outcomes might have been achieved without the AAG projects, presumably under the previous adult guidance structure. It is acknowledged by all the stakeholders that the measurement of adult guidance provision and its outputs has, in the past, been extremely limited. The Duffner report comments that,

“throughout the evidence we heard, reference was made to an inability to compare performance across companies”

1.57 With no clear indication of the scale, scope or quality of the services delivered previously it is difficult to make an accurate assessment of the changes that have taken place. To provide some measure of the level of service available prior to the introduction of the AAG projects we have reviewed what was then described as the current provision in the original partnership bid documents. A table containing this review is presented in Annex 2. This has necessarily been fairly broad brush, but it highlights the considerable variability of provision. Each area is categorised as good, fair, limited or very limited. It should be borne in mind that even where the service is described as fair, there are likely to be significant issues related to the quality, consistency and cohesiveness of provision.

1.58 The analysis suggests that overall, provision was patchy. In several areas there was a stronger more coherent delivery, for example in Orkney and Central, while in other areas there was virtually no support beyond New Deal Gateway. In most there was some basic guidance, but this was usually fragmented, offering services restricted to specific groups or geographies.

1.59 The level of additionality will, therefore, vary by area. The discussions in both Tayside and Edinburgh shed some light on this. In Tayside for example, the projects introduced some entirely new approaches and also worked with new target groups. Almost all of the clients that participated are likely to be additional, with the exception of those that might otherwise have used the New Directions initiative in Dundee. In Edinburgh, there was already a relatively strong partnership structure in place delivering an adult guidance service and developing a helpline. The project allowed this service to develop its technology more rapidly and to target rural communities and excluded groups. To assess additionality more accurately it would be necessary to look closely at the scale and quality of provision available in each local area in order to compare it with the situation now.

1.60 Much of the additionality generated by these projects relates to changes in quality and the range of resources and information available. This is enhanced by the increasing skills
and capacity that the projects have helped to build up. Although some participants may have been able to access services under the previous structure, it is less likely that the support would have been as effective. As the Careers Scotland service has developed, building resources and structures, it is likely that the level of additionality through quality has risen.

1.61 Further evidence of the counterfactual is the responses of clients that have used other services in the past (37%). The results indicate that the AAG service represents a qualitative improvement on other services (39% thought that the AAG service was much better and 14% a bit better, while 9% thought it worse than alternatives they had used). This conclusion is supported by the satisfaction scores in the survey. It is not possible to draw a direct comparison between satisfaction with the AAG service and what went before, but in the light of the review of previous provision and anecdotal information the scores are sufficiently high to suggest that there has been a major increase in the quality of the service delivered. The satisfaction scores can be used as a baseline for future monitoring.

1.62 Clearly the lack of any baseline on the scale or quality of service prior to the introduction of AAG makes it difficult to assess the counterfactual case. Based on the evidence that we have, from the survey and an assessment of what was previously in place, we believe that the projects have added substantially to the scale and quality of provision. Where there was little or no service, the AAG service is wholly additional. Where a service already existed, the projects have targeted groups that were not participating in the previous service and so most of this activity would be additional. More generally, the additional resources (particularly staff) have allowed many more clients to participate than could have been the case before.

1.63 Finally, the step increase in activity in the final quarter of last year (see Chapter two) suggests that many of the clients participating have been stimulated to do so by the promotion of Careers Scotland. Again this would indicate that these clients are additional.

1.64 Overall, it would be reasonable to conclude that a high proportion (perhaps 70% - 90%) of the outcomes could not have been achieved without the projects.
ANNEX 2  SURVEY RESULTS REPORT - WAVE 2

BACKGROUND AND METHODOLOGY

2.1 This report presents the findings from a follow-up survey of users of Carers Scotland All Age Guidance (AAG) services. The telephone survey was conducted by NFO Social Research between July and early September 2003, approximately six months after respondents took part in an initial baseline survey. This report focuses on the findings from the follow-up survey although, where appropriate, comparisons are made with the results of the baseline survey.

METHODOLOGY

Sample

2.2 AAG clients were first recruited to take part in the study by Careers Scotland staff over a two-month period from late August 2002 to late October 2002. Staff were asked to try and recruit all AAG clients with whom they had contact during this period. Information on the research, including guidance for staff on recruiting clients, information for clients and client consent forms, was cascaded to all staff that had contact with clients by the local AAG managers. Interviews were then staggered, so that individuals were contacted approximately three months after they were recruited to the study.

2.3 A total of 1,035 consent forms were returned for checking and collation to NFO Social Research. Sixty-one phone numbers proved to be incorrect, giving an eventual sample size of 974. Baseline interviews were achieved with 596 respondents, giving a response rate of 61%. However, of these 596 respondents, 37 were aged 16 or 17 years-old. As AAG money is intended to be targeted on adults aged 18 or over, the decision was taken to exclude these respondents from the data for analysis.

2.4 A total of 506 of the initial 559 respondents (excluding the 16 and 17 year-olds, who were not re-contacted) gave permission for NFO to contact them again for a follow-up interview. These interviews were carried out between July and early September 2003, approximately six months after the baseline interviews. Interviews were achieved with 371 respondents – a response rate of 73%. Sixty-six per cent of respondents aged 18 or older who took part in the baseline survey also took part in the follow-up survey.
Data collection method

2.5 Both the baseline and the follow-up surveys were carried out by NFO Social Research using Computer Assisted Telephone Interviewing (CATI). CATI interviewing facilitates the use of relatively complex routing, since it automatically directs interviewers to the relevant question. We were therefore able to pursue different lines of questioning with different groups of AAG clients – for example, those who had been in touch with Careers Scotland since their baseline interview, and those who had no further contact.

Weighting

2.6 Weighting was used at both Waves of the survey in order to try and counter any response bias in the sample resulting from differential recruitment or participation in different areas. Using monitoring data from Careers Scotland, the profile of respondents in the data was matched to the actual profile of AAG service users in different areas of Scotland during the months in which respondents were recruited. The weights were based on a combination of the age group respondents fell into, and the area of the Careers Scotland office they had visited. All the proportions presented in this report are weighted unless otherwise stated.

2.7 For the Scottish Enterprise area, the weights are based on monitoring data on the age of AAG clients across the 12 SEN areas for September and October 2002 (the months in which recruitment for the study took place). For the HIE area, monitoring data was only available by quarter, so the figures for the third quarter of 2002 (October to December) were used to calculate weights. The fact that recruitment took place over two, rather than three months was taken into account in calculating the HIE weights from the monitoring data.

2.8 It is worth noting that there were a particularly high number of respondents from one area where there was a large-scale redundancy during the recruitment period. Weighting the data back to the overall area profile of All Age guidance clients will readjust the potential bias introduced by the high number of recruits from this area.
CHARACTERISTICS OF RESPONDENTS

Background and Methodology

2.9 Both the baseline and follow-up surveys captured a range of demographic details about respondents. This section outlines respondent’s characteristics, comparing any changes in the overall profile of respondents between the baseline and follow-up surveys. Working status is discussed later in this Annex.

Sex and Age

2.10 The sex profile of respondents is broadly similar across the two surveys. In terms of age, the follow-up survey included a lower proportion of respondents aged 25-34 years-old and a slightly higher proportion of respondents aged 35 to 59.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.1: Sex of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Base</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.2: Age of respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refused age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Base</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Socio-Economic Class

2.11 Figure 2-1 shows the socio-economic class of All Age Guidance clients who took part in the two surveys. It was only possible to derive this information for respondents who were either unemployed, or were employed and gave a job description when asked, which explains the smaller base sizes. The Scotland wide figures are based on the National Readership Survey 2002 (on which quotas for the NFO Scottish Opinion Survey are based).
The figures show an increase in the proportion of respondents falling in to the C1 category in the follow-up survey, and a significant decrease in the proportion of DEs. This is likely to be a result of the increase in the proportion of respondents in employment at the time of the follow-up survey compared with the baseline survey and the corresponding decrease in the proportion of unemployed respondents. The fact that the bulk of the increase is at C1 suggests that the types of jobs people are finding tend to be junior non-manual positions.

Figure 2.1: Socio-economic class of baseline and follow-up survey respondents

2.12 It is worth noting that this decrease in the proportion of DEs is not because respondents who fell into the DE category at the time of the baseline survey were less likely to take part in the follow-up survey. The proportion of baseline respondents falling in to the DE category was very similar among those who did and did not take part in the follow-up, as shown in Figure 2-2. Further, the increase in the proportion of C1s from the baseline to the follow-up survey is still significant, even if respondents who did not take part in the follow-up survey are excluded from analysis.
Figure 2.2: Socio-economic class at Baseline of participants and non-participants in the Follow-up survey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Follow-up non-participants</th>
<th>Follow-up participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AB</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DE</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bases: Non-participants = 175, Participants = 321. NB base includes respondents who were employed and gave a job description, and respondents who were unemployed at the time of their baseline interview.

Ethnicity

2.13 The follow-up survey included a question on ethnicity. Ninety-six per cent of respondents were white, while 4% were from ethnic minorities (1% Asian, Scottish Asian or British Asian, 2% Black, Black Scottish or Black British and 1% “other” ethnic background). According to the 2001 Scottish Census, 2% of the population are from non-white ethnic groups, so the survey would suggest that people from ethnic minorities are not under-represented among Careers Scotland All Age clients.

Household Type

2.14 Table 2-3 shows the household type of participants in the baseline and follow-up surveys as well as comparable figures for Scottish non-pensioner households, where possible/appropriate. A higher proportion of respondents to the follow-up survey compared with respondents to the baseline are part of a couple with children.

2.15 The Scottish figures were calculated on the basis of data from the Scottish Household Survey 2001-2002. The categories used in the SHS do not map precisely on to the categories used in the All Age Guidance surveys (see footnotes to table 2-3). However, broadly speaking the household profile of respondents in the follow-up All Age Guidance Survey is similar to the profile of non-pensioner households in Scotland as a whole.
Table 2.3: Household type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Type</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Follow-up</th>
<th>Scotland (excluding pensioner households)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single person</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple, no children</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>n/a&lt;sup&gt;11&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single parent</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple with child(ren)</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing a household with parents/relatives</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>n/a&lt;sup&gt;12&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing a household with other adults</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some other kind of household</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>*&lt;sup&gt;13&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base</td>
<td>559</td>
<td>371</td>
<td>21,121</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>11</sup> NB The “small adult” category in the Scottish Household Survey includes any household containing two adults of non-pensioner age and no children. Strictly speaking, this is not directly comparable with the “Couple, no children” category used in the All Age Guidance Surveys, since the small adult household need not necessarily be a couple. Twenty-five per cent of non-pensioner households fall in to the “small adult category”.

<sup>12</sup> Again, there is no category in the SHS that is directly comparable to these categories. However, 14% of non-pensioner households in Scotland as a whole are “large adult households” (households containing three or more adults and no children).

<sup>13</sup> * indicates a proportion smaller than 1%.
CONTACT WITH CAREERS SCOTLAND

2.16 Respondents to the follow-up survey were asked whether they had been in contact with Careers Scotland, whether in person, by phone, e-mail or post, in the period since they took part in the baseline survey. Ten per cent (n = 38) of respondents said they had been in contact with Careers Scotland since we last spoke to them. The majority of respondents (84%) had not been in contact with Careers Scotland for at least six months (Table 2.4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.4: Last time had contact with Careers Scotland (all respondents except those who could not remember if been contact with CS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the last month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than a month, up to three months ago</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than three months, up to six months ago</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Six months ago or longer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t know/can’t remember</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 357

2.17 Those respondents who said they had been in contact with Careers Scotland since the baseline survey were asked a more detailed series of questions about this more recent contact. Due to the small number of respondents involved, the scope for analysis of responses to these questions is limited. Proportions are given rather than numbers or percentages, since the small base size means that statistical inferences from this sample are inappropriate.

2.18 Half of respondents who had been in contact with Careers Scotland since the previous interview had been in touch with them three or more times, while just over a third had been in touch once or twice. The high proportion who had been in touch more than once or twice in the intervening period between the two surveys may suggest that these respondents felt the need for regular, on-going support from Careers Scotland.

2.19 In terms of the nature of more recent contact with Careers Scotland, around two-thirds of respondents had discussed possible career options or career planning with Careers Scotland, while just under half had been in to get information in person and two-fifths had been finding information on the Careers Scotland website.

2.20 Almost all respondents with more recent experience of Careers Scotland had received some type of information from Careers Scotland since taking part in the baseline
survey. Around three-quarters had received information on career ideas/planning or career choices, while a similar proportion had received information about specific careers. Half had received information on options for retraining and/or training or education options, while just under a third had received details of other agencies to contact.

2.21 Just under half of respondents who had been in more recent contact with Careers Scotland had spent any time in meetings with Careers Scotland advisors or staff since the baseline survey. The main issues discussed were: how to approach career planning; possible career ideas or choices; retraining/training or education options and job-related skills, such as preparing CVs; interview techniques and presentation skills.

2.22 Around two-fifths of respondents who had used Careers Scotland since their baseline interview said they had “used all of the information or taken the advice or guidance fully on board”, while a further two-fifths had used some of it or taken some of it on board.

2.23 In addition to the findings reported above, respondents who had been in contact with Careers Scotland since their baseline interview were asked a series of questions aimed at assessing how satisfied they were with this recent contact. The findings from these questions are reported in the section on overall satisfaction, below.

Reasons for Lack of Contact with Careers Scotland since baseline Interview

2.24 The most commonly given reasons for not having contact with Careers Scotland since the baseline surveys were that the respondent had started a job since then (26%), that they did not need to contact them, since they were taking career or training options further on their own (14%) and that they had no need in general to re-contact them (11%). A very small minority of respondents (2%) said they had not been in contact because they were dissatisfied with the service received, while 2% said they had not re-contacted them as they were still deciding what they wanted to do. This suggests that in general the majority of clients feel they receive the help they need from Careers Scotland to be able to move-on and manage their own careers for the moment without returning for further help (though see Section H for information on the likelihood of respondents returning to Careers Scotland for help in the future).
2.5: Reasons why not had contact with Careers Scotland since baseline interview (% of respondents who have not been in contact with CS since baseline survey)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Started a job since then</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No need as taking career/training options further on their own</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No need (general)</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working so don’t need the service</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No need as now know/have decided what to do</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decided against changing career/job</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal circumstances (e.g. illness) mean haven’t been pursuing</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>career/training options</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No need as received enough information/help from CS already</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started/applied for a course since then</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Currently waiting for outcome of job applications</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS haven’t contacted them and they didn’t feel the need to contact CS</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Still unsure of what want to do/still deciding what to do</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS couldn’t help them find a job</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissatisfied with service received</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 319

Contact with other Organisations

2.25 Seventeen per cent of all respondents had used an organisation other than Careers Scotland for information, advice or guidance since they took part in the baseline survey. This is lower than the 37% of participants in the baseline survey who said they had used another organisation for careers-related advice in the previous two years. Those who were currently in education or training were more likely than those in employment to have used another organisation. As in the baseline survey, the Job Centre was the other organisation most commonly used for alternative or additional information, advice and guidance (53% of those who had used another organisation), followed by university careers services (13%), careers website or other website (12%) and college careers services (10%).
Table 2.6: Other organisations used for information, advice or guidance since baseline interview (all respondents who used another organisation)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job Centre</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A university careers service</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers website/other website</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A college careers service</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment agencies/recruitment consultancies</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The local authority</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn Direct/Learning Centre</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Local Enterprise Company</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 66

2.26 Among respondents who had recently used another organisation for careers-related information, advice or guidance, half (48%) thought Careers Scotland was either “much better” or “a bit better”, and half thought (49%) thought there was no difference.14 The main reasons given for assessing Careers Scotland as better than other organisations were that people preferred face-to-face or personal contact, that staff were more knowledgeable and that they were able to give more detailed information and advice.

---

14 NB due to differences in the sample size, differences between the baseline and follow-up results in the assessment of CS relative to other organisations are not statistically significant.
SATISFACTION WITH CAREERS SCOTLAND ALL AGE GUIDANCE SERVICE

2.27 Among the thirty-eight respondents who had been in contact with Careers Scotland since their baseline interview, the majority were either “very satisfied” or “quite satisfied” with the following aspects of the Careers Scotland All Age Guidance service:

- opening hours
- speed of service
- level of privacy
- availability of staff
- level of encouragement and support from staff
- ability of staff to explain things clearly
- how much staff knew about career options

2.28 No more than three or four respondents expressed dissatisfaction with any of these elements. In relation to the availability of computers and the Careers Scotland website, satisfaction was slightly lower, but this is explained by the higher proportion of respondents who said these factors did not apply to them, rather than by any increase in dissatisfaction. Around a fifth of respondents were dissatisfied with transport access to the Careers Scotland Centre from their home. However, because of the small numbers involved this is not significantly higher than the level of dissatisfaction reported with any other element.

2.29 Around a quarter of respondents who had been in contact with Careers Scotland since the baseline survey rated their more recent experience of the service as either “a lot” or “a bit” better than the service they received when they first contacted Careers Scotland. Reasons for assessing their recent contact more highly were:

- that they had been encouraged to call back for more help
- that the advisor had been better or more knowledgeable
- that there had been more computers available, and
- that the respondent had had a better idea of what they wanted so had been able to get more help.

2.30 Most other respondents thought the service was “about the same”.

103
Likelihood to Recommend

2.31 Table 2.7 shows how likely respondents said they would be to recommend Careers Scotland to friends and family who need information, advice or guidance on careers, training or employment, broken down by the current economic activity of respondents. Overall, responses to this question indicate that levels of satisfaction with Careers Scotland All Age services are very high – 95% of all respondents are “very” or “fairly” likely to recommend Careers Scotland to family and friends. However, the proportion of unemployed respondents “very likely” to recommend Careers Scotland is somewhat lower than for employed respondents or respondents in education or training (45% compared with 69% and 73% respectively). This may suggest that unemployed respondents are slightly less satisfied than respondents in employment or education and training with the service offered them, although clearly responses to this question indicate that levels of satisfaction among unemployed respondents are still very high.

| Table 2.7: Likelihood to recommend Careers Scotland by current economic activity (% of follow up respondents) |
|--------------------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
|                                    | In education/training | Unemployed | Employed (FT, PT, self-employed) | Full-time carer | Other economically inactive | ALL |
| Very likely to recommend            | 72%                | 45%        | 69%                    | 89%              | 52%              | 66% |
| Fairly likely to recommend          | 27%                | 44%        | 27%                    | 11%              | 27%              | 29% |
| Fairly unlikely to recommend        | 1%                 | 2%         | 3%                     | -                | 35               | 2%  |
| Very unlikely to recommend          | -                  | 2%         | 1%                     | -                | -                | 1%  |
| Don’t know                          | -                  | 7%         | *                      | -                | 18%              | 1%  |
| **Base**                            | **61**             | **55**     | **267**                | **11**           | **19**           | **371** |

Potential areas for Improvement

2.32 Forty-one per cent of all respondents to the follow-up survey thought there was nothing that needed to be improved about the Careers Scotland service, while 22% were unsure or could not think of anything that could be improved. The most common suggestions for improvement from the remaining respondents were more publicity of Careers Scotland services (7% of respondents), better or more follow-up contact (6%) and shorter waiting times for seeing advisors (4%).
Table 2.8: Aspects of the CS service which could be improved (% of respondents)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>% of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nothing</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t know/can’t say</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More publicity of CS services</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better/more follow-up contact</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shorter waiting times for seeing advisors</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More specialised career info/advice</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved info/advice for older people/service geared too much to younger people</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved knowledge of funding options for education/training</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More staff</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longer opening hours/weekend opening</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location inconvenient/inaccessible</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 371
IMPACT ON CHOICES AND EMPLOYMENT PROSPECTS

2.33 Respondents were asked a range of questions aimed at establishing the impact of Careers Scotland on their current and future employment prospects and their career management skills. Some of these questions related to perceived impacts – i.e. the extent to which respondents thought Careers Scotland had influenced them to make (the right) decisions – while some sought to establish more objective measures of outcomes – e.g. changes in employment status, actual actions taken following contact with Careers Scotland. These latter types of measures are discussed in Chapter G, on outcomes, while respondents' perceptions of the impact of their contact with Careers Scotland on (a) their choices and employment prospects and (b) their career management skills are discussed in this and the following Chapter.

Impact on Choices

2.34 Table 2.9 shows the extent to which respondents agreed or disagreed with a range of statements aimed at assessing respondent’s views of the overall impact of their contact with Careers Scotland All Age Guidance service on their subsequent career and training related choices. The results from the follow-up survey (f) are compared with the results from the baseline survey (b). For direct comparability, only data for respondents who took part in both surveys has been included.

2.35 Overall, respondents’ assessment of the impact of their contact with Careers Scotland remains very positive – 67% agreed or strongly agreed that it helped them make the best possible choices, while 73% agreed or strongly agreed that it made them more open about their options. Similarly, 95% and 91% of follow-up respondents respectively disagreed or strongly disagreed that they felt pushed into doing something they did not want to do or that their contact with Careers Scotland had a negative impact on their choices. There was a slight shift between the baseline and follow-up survey towards respondents simply agreeing or disagreeing, rather than “strongly” agreeing or disagreeing with these statements. This may be explained by the fact that the majority of follow-up respondents had not had any further contact with Careers Scotland since their baseline interview, which may mean the impact of their contact is now less closely felt (and therefore less strongly expressed).
Table 2.9: Agreement with statements about Careers Scotland (% of respondents who took part in both the baseline and follow-up surveys)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neither agree nor disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It helped me make the best possible choices</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It made me more open about my options</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I felt pushed into doing something I didn’t want to do</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It had a negative impact on my choices</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Nb diff bases for each statement – need to do baseline ones in spss

Impact on Employment Prospects

2.36 All respondents to the follow-up survey were asked how much they thought the information, advice or guidance they received from Careers Scotland has helped their employment prospects, either in their current jobs or for future jobs. Seventy per cent of respondents thought it had helped improve their prospects either “a little” (41%) or “a lot” (29%). Fifteen per cent thought their contact with Careers Scotland had not improved their prospects at all. This suggests that the majority of clients feel their contact with All Age Guidance services has had a positive impact on their employment prospects and that this impact is sustained some six months after the majority of respondents had ceased contact with Careers Scotland.

Figure 2.3: Extent to which information, advice or guidance received from CS has helped employment prospects (% of follow-up respondents)

Base = 371
Respondents who said Careers Scotland had helped improve their employment prospects, either “a bit” or “a lot”, were then asked which aspects of the Careers Scotland Service had particularly helped improve their employment prospects. Twenty-seven per cent said Careers Scotland had improved their awareness of the options open to them or helped them to consider different options, while 20% said it had given them encouragement/confidence or changed their view of what they can do. Seventeen per cent of respondents said they had found help with their CV particularly useful, while 12% mentioned help with interview skills. These findings suggest that clients particularly value advice or guidance which focuses on expanding their horizons and improving their confidence and help with the practical skills required to find a job.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect of the CS service</th>
<th>Percentage of respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Improved awareness of options/helped client consider different options open to them</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouragement/boost to confidence/changed client’s view of what they can do</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help/guidance in finding a direction/making a career plan/making choices</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with CV</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with interview skills</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Usefulness/quality of the information/advice provided</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Face-to-face advice particularly good</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Useful info/advice on training/education generally</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensiveness/amount of information provided</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enthusiasm/helpfulness of staff</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 249
IMPACT ON CAREER MANAGEMENT SKILLS

2.38 A key aim of Careers Scotland’s All Age services is to support people to develop the skills they need to manage their own careers, whether these are practical skills like preparing a CV or more cognitive skills like knowing where to find information about careers and being able to make decisions about their career. The follow-up survey of All Age Guidance clients included a series of questions aimed at establishing whether clients feel more confident in relation to these skills than they did a year ago, how useful they perceive these skills to be, and to what extent any improvement in respondents’ career management skills might be attributed to their contact with Careers Scotland.

Practical Skills

2.39 Respondents were asked how confident they felt now about various practical skills compared to how confident they felt a year ago. Since the majority of respondents to the baseline survey (87%) stated that the occasion on which they were recruited to the research in September/October 2002 was their first contact with Careers Scotland, Table 2.11 gives some indication of client’s confidence before and after their contact with Careers Scotland.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Much more confident now</th>
<th>A bit more confident now</th>
<th>About the same</th>
<th>A bit less confident now</th>
<th>A lot less confident now</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preparing your CV</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applying for a new job</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going for a job interview</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applying for an education or training course</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 371

2.40 Although overall around half of respondents reported feeling more confident now than they did a year ago in relation to these kinds of skills, there were some significant differences between groups of respondents. Respondents who were currently unemployed were significantly less likely than employed respondents to report feeling more confident in relation to these kinds of skills (Figure 2.4). Men were also less likely than women to report feeling more confident in relation to each skill with the exception of preparing their CV (Figure 2.5). As shown later, a higher proportion of men than women were unemployed at
the time of the follow-up survey. However, these differences in confidence between the sexes remain even when unemployed respondents are excluded from the analysis, suggesting that differences by sex are not related simply to differences in working status.

Figure 2.4: Proportion of respondents “much more” or “a bit more confident” in relation to practical skills (% of follow-up respondents currently unemployed or employed)

Bases: Unemployed = 55, Employed = 267
Figure 2.5: Proportion of respondents “much more” or “a bit more confident” in relation to practical skills by sex (% of follow-up respondents)

Bases: Men = 165, Women = 206

Information Finding Skills

2.41 Around three-quarters of respondents reported some improvement in their knowledge of how to find out about careers and about training and education over the last year (Table 2.12). Again, a slightly lower proportion of unemployed respondents compared with employed respondents reported any improvement in their level of knowledge. However, there was no difference in the results for men and women.

Table 2.12: Current level of knowledge (compared with knowledge a year ago) (% of respondents)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Know a lot more know</th>
<th>Know a bit more now</th>
<th>Know about the same</th>
<th>Know a bit less now</th>
<th>Know a lot less now</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Finding information about careers</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding information about training and education</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 371

Decision Making Skills

2.42 Between 70% and 80% of respondents to the follow-up survey reported an increase in confidence in relation to making decisions about their careers, as shown in Table 2.13. As
with the other types of skills, unemployed respondents were less likely than employed respondents to say they felt more confident in relation to deciding to change career and deciding what jobs they were suited for.

### Table 2.13: Current level of confidence (compared with confidence a year ago) (% of respondents)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Much more confident now</th>
<th>A bit more confident now</th>
<th>About the same</th>
<th>A bit less confident now</th>
<th>A lot less confident now</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Deciding to change your career</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deciding what jobs you are best suited for</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deciding what kind of education or training you need to get the job you want</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 371

**Importance attached to different types of Skills/Knowledge**

2.43 Table 2.14, below, shows the extent to which respondents thought each of the “skill sets” included in the questionnaire would help their future employment prospects. The majority of respondents thought each “skill set” would help them either “a lot” or “a little”. However, a higher proportion of respondents said practical skills such as preparing CVs would help “a lot”, which may suggest that these kinds of skills are seen as particularly important in terms of future employment by Careers Scotland All Age clients.

### Table 2.14: Extent to which skills/knowledge will help employment prospects in the future (% of respondents reporting any improvement in relation to these skills/knowledge)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A lot</th>
<th>A little</th>
<th>Not much</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>Don’t know/refused</th>
<th>BASE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Practical skills</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information finding skills/knowledge</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision-making skills</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Impact of Contact with Careers Scotland on Career Management Skills**

2.44 Table 2.15 shows that while the vast majority of respondents thought Careers Scotland had helped improve their knowledge or how to find out about careers/training and
helped improve their confidence in relation to career planning, a slightly lower proportion thought they had helped improve their confidence in relation to practical skills like preparing a CV etc. Given the apparent importance placed on these kinds of practical skills in terms of future employment prospects, as shown above, Careers Scotland might wish to consider how it could better support clients to develop these skills.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.15: Extent to which Careers Scotland has helped improve confidence/knowledge (%)</th>
<th>A lot</th>
<th>A little</th>
<th>Not much</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>Don’t know/refused</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Confidence in relation to practical skills</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of how to find out about careers/training</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence in relation to career planning</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 371

2.45 Unemployed respondents were less likely than employed respondents to say that Careers Scotland had helped improve their skills/knowledge “a lot” rather than “a little”. This was true for each type of skill/knowledge discussed above (figure 2.6). Given that unemployed respondents also appear to have made less progress in terms of their confidence/knowledge in relation to these “skill sets” this may suggest a need to look at the support provided to unemployed people.
Figure 2.6: Respondents who thought Careers Scotland had helped improve skills/knowledge “a lot” (% of unemployed/unemployed respondents)

Bases: Unemployed = 55, employed = 267

2.46 Respondents who said they were “much more confident” or “knew a lot more” now in relation to the nine specific skills/areas of knowledge included in the questionnaire were more likely than less confident/knowledgeable respondents to say that their contact with Career Scotland had helped them “a lot”. For example, 80% of respondents who said they now knew “a lot more” about finding information about careers said their contact with Careers Scotland had helped improve their knowledge “a lot”, compared with 33% of those who said they now knew “a bit more” and just 13% of those who thought they knew “about the same”. Respondents who were “a bit more confident” or “knew a bit more” were more likely to say that Careers Scotland had helped them “a little”. This suggests a strong link between perceived improvements in confidence/knowledge and respondent’s assessment of the impact of help received from Careers Scotland.
OUTCOMES

2.47 The follow-up survey collected data on outcomes achieved since the baseline interview, including:

- actions taken by clients (e.g. applying for jobs/courses)
- current economic activity (which can be compared with clients’ economic activity when they first contact CS and at the time of their baseline interview)

2.48 The survey also included questions to try and establish to what extent clients would attribute these outcomes to their contact with Careers Scotland.

2.49 The majority of the tables and figures in this section include data only for those respondents who took part in both surveys. This should ensure that the findings are comparing like with like – any changes between the baseline and follow-up surveys are genuine changes for this group of clients, and are not just a result of differences between the baseline and follow-up sample. However, it is still possible that those who did not take part in the follow-up survey have had different outcomes since their baseline interviews. For example, it might be that those who did not take part in the follow-up survey were more likely than participants to report negative outcomes at either stage. If this were the case, then the findings might not have been more negative had everyone from the baseline sample also taken part in the follow-up survey. There is therefore a need for caution in applying these findings to the population of AAG clients.

Actions Taken

2.50 Respondents to the follow-up survey were asked what actions (from a list read out to them by the interviewer) they had taken since we last interviewed them (roughly six months previously). The results are compared in Table 2.16 with the proportion of baseline respondents who said they had taken such actions since first contacting Careers Scotland. Given that the majority of baseline respondents (87%) said the occasion when they were recruited to the research was their first contact with Careers Scotland, these findings can be taken as roughly representing (a) actions taken in the first three months after contacting Careers Scotland and (b) actions taken 3-9 months after first contacting Careers Scotland.
Table 2.16: Actions taken (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>By baseline interview (all respondents who took part in both surveys)</th>
<th>Since baseline interview (all follow-up respondents)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Applied for a job</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started a job/new job</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied for training and education courses</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started or completed a training or education course(^{15})</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into sources of financial support</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found additional financial support</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into new childcare options</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made new or better care arrangements</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looked into other care options</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Done voluntary work</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had no outcome</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Base</strong></td>
<td>368</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.51 Fifty-one per cent of follow-up respondents reported having started a job/new job since taking part in the baseline survey. This compares with 33% of respondents at the baseline survey who reported having started a job/new job since first contacting Careers Scotland and is reflected in figures on changes in working status between the surveys, below. A higher proportion of respondents also reported having started or completed an education or training course in the last six months (33%) compared with the proportion of baseline respondents who reported having done so since first contacting Careers Scotland (26%). In relation to the other actions listed, a similar proportion of respondents reported having taken such actions since the baseline survey as reported having done so prior to the baseline survey.

2.52 These findings suggest that the majority of clients are continuing to take positive action in relation to careers and training some 3-9 months after initial contact with Careers Scotland All Age Guidance services. Further, given that the majority of follow-up respondents (90%) had not had further contact with Careers Scotland since the baseline survey many clients are taking these actions without further support from Careers Scotland.

\(^{15}\) NB In the follow-up survey respondents were asked separately about whether they had started an education or training course and whether they had completed an education or training course. Twenty-five per cent of respondents had started an training or education course since the baseline survey and 16% had completed one. Overall, 33% had either started or completed a course (or done both) since the baseline survey.
However, a significant minority (9%) of follow-up respondents said they had had none of the types of outcomes listed in Table 2.16 since their baseline interview,

2.53 Figure 2.7, below, shows the proportion of respondents who reported starting a job/new job since their baseline interview by their economic activity when they first contacted Careers Scotland. A higher proportion of respondents who were unemployed or facing redundancy when they first contacted Careers Scotland compared with respondents who were employed reporting having started a job/new job since the baseline survey.

**Figure 2.7: Proportion of respondents starting a job/new job since baseline interview by economic activity when first contacted Careers Scotland (%)**

![Bar chart showing proportions](image)

Bases: In education/training = 38; Unemployed = 98; Employed = 180; Facing redundancy = 86; FT carer = 56; Other economically inactive = 16

**Impact of Careers Scotland On Decisions Taken**

2.54 Respondents who mentioned having taken any of the actions listed in Table 2.16, above, since the baseline survey were asked how much, if at all, the information, advice or guidance they received from Careers Scotland had influenced their decision to do those things. Overall, 37% said services received from Careers Scotland had influenced their decisions “a lot” while 30% said it had influenced them “a little”. Thirty per cent said help received from Careers Scotland had not influenced their decisions much or at all. Men were significantly less likely than women to say that their contact with Careers Scotland had any influence on their decisions (Figure 2.8).
Figure 2.8: How much information, advice or guidance from Careers Scotland influenced decision by sex (% of respondents who have had an outcome since Baseline interview)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A lot</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A little</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not much</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don't know</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bases: Men = 147, Women = 177, All = 324

Changes in working status

2.55 The baseline survey asked respondents for (a) their working status when they first contacted Careers Scotland and (b) their current working status. The follow-up survey again asked respondents for their current working status. Comparing the data from these questions gives us an idea of changes in working status over time, from when respondents first contacted Careers Scotland, to roughly three months after first contact (baseline interview), to some nine months later (follow-up interview).16

16 This is based on the fact that the majority of respondents to the baseline survey (87%) said that the occasion on which they were recruited was their first contact with Careers Scotland. In some cases, the baseline survey will have taken place longer than three months after first contact and the follow-up survey longer than nine months later.
Table 2.17: Working status of respondents (all respondents who took part in both baseline and follow-up surveys)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Working status when first contacted CS</th>
<th>Working status at time of baseline interview</th>
<th>Working status at follow-up interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facing redundancy</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At school</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In training</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At university full-time</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At university part-time</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At college full-time</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At college part-time</td>
<td>*%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed part-time</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed full-time</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employed/other</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In voluntary work</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time parent/carer</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanently sick or disabled</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unable to work because of short-term illness</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can’t remember</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base</td>
<td>368</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.56 Table 2.17 shows a significant decline at each stage in the proportion of unemployed and a corresponding increase in the proportion in employment, particularly full-time. This pattern is even more evident when the respondents in part-time, full-time or self-employment are banded together (Figure 2.9). However, it is again worth noting that these outcomes may have been different for respondents who did not take part in the follow-up survey.

17 Owing to the high number of respondents who were facing redundancy at the time of their first contact with Careers Scotland, slightly different patterns emerge in the unweighted data. However, overall the pattern of increasing employment at each stage remains the same, as does the decrease in those in unemployment from the time of the baseline to the follow-up survey.
Figure 2.9: Changes in working status (all respondents who took part in both waves)

![Bar chart showing changes in working status](chart.png)

Base = all those who took part in both the baseline and follow-up survey (n = 368)

**Forecasted employment status**

2.57 Table 2.17 shows what respondents think they will be doing in a year’s time – their predictions rather than their aspirations. Respondents were allowed to give more than one answer – so for example they might say they think they will be employed in their current job but also taking a college course. While a third of respondents think they will be employed in their current job, around 31% think they will be employed in a different job. This suggests that around a third of these clients will be making further career transitions over the next year.
Table 2.18: Forecasted employment status by current economic activity (% of respondents)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In education/training</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed in current job</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>7% (^{18})</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed in a different job</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In training</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At University</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At college</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BASE</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>267</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.58 Thirteen per cent of those currently in employment said they think they will be in training in a year’s time and 10% thought they would be at University. However, some of these respondents may already have been in part-time education or training at the same time as being in employment at the time of the follow-up survey. In order to examine the extent to which these figures represent new moves towards education and training, the results were analysed for those who were in employment but were not in any kind of education or training at the time of their follow-up interview. Twenty per cent of these respondents said they think they will be in some kind of education or training in a year’s time. This suggests that a significant proportion of employed clients do anticipate making moves into education or training. Figure 2.9 shows these results broken down by the different kinds of training mentioned.

\(^{18}\) This somewhat counter-intuitive finding is likely to relate to the fact that a small proportion of respondents who said they were unemployed also said they were doing voluntary work or training. Presumably they would like to stay on in their voluntary/training role on a permanent basis.
Figure 2.9: Whether will be in education or training in a year’s time (% of respondents currently in employment and not in education or training)

In training: 9%
At University: 6%
At college: 5%

Base = 238
FUTURE USE OF CAREERS SCOTLAND

2.59 In addition to providing practical help and advice about careers, Careers Scotland also aims to teach adults the skills necessary to be able to manage their own careers effectively in the future. If clients do not return for further help from Careers Scotland, this is not necessarily viewed as a negative outcome, since it might be that they have gained the skills and confidence required to manage their careers without further help. This consideration informed a range of questions in the follow-up survey aimed at understanding whether and how respondents intended to use Career Scotland’s services in the future.

Likelihood of Using Careers Scotland in the Future

2.60 Table 2.19 shows how likely respondents said they would be to use Careers Scotland or the Careers Scotland website in particular situations where they might need advice or guidance in the future. Although the majority of respondents said they would be “very” or “fairly” likely to use Careers Scotland services if they were considering a career move or if they wanted to find out about education or training, a significant minority (17% and 16% respectively) said they would be “not very” or “not at all” likely to use Careers Scotland in these situations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.19: Likelihood of using Careers Scotland or the Careers Scotland website in the future (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very likely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>… if you were considering a career move</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>… if you were wanting to find out about education or training options</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base = 371

2.61 The main reasons respondents gave for being relatively unlikely to use Careers Scotland if they were considering a career move were that they didn’t find Careers Scotland helpful in the past or had a bad past experience with them (around a quarter of the 65 respondents who said they were unlikely to use CS said this), that they have no need to use Careers Scotland for this kind of advice as they have now decided what they want to do (around a fifth of respondents), and that they feel they would need specialist advice which Careers Scotland could not provide (again, around a fifth). The last issue may reflect criticisms by a small minority of respondents to the baseline survey that the information offered by Careers Scotland was too general. If Careers Scotland cannot realistically offer highly specialist advice (e.g. on specific employers or careers), then it may be that attention
needs to be paid to managing clients expectations to ensure that they are aware of the services that are and are not available through Careers Scotland.

2.62 The main reasons respondents gave for being “not very” or “not at all” likely to use Careers Scotland in the future if they wanted to find out about education or training options were that they would contact educational establishments directly themselves (a fifth of respondents), that they didn’t find Careers Scotland helpful in the past (just over a tenth of respondents), and that they do not need any more advice as they have all the information they need (around a tenth). The first and last of these reasons would suggest that at least some Careers Scotland clients do now feel that they have the information-finding skills and knowledge required to enable them to take forward education and training options themselves in the future.

Nature of Future Contact

2.63 Respondents who said they were either “very” or “fairly likely” to use Careers Scotland in the situations listed in Table 2.19 were then read a list of different types of Careers Scotland services and asked which of these they would use Careers Scotland for in this situation. The majority of respondents who said they would use Careers Scotland in the future if they were considering a career move or for finding out about education or training said they would want to discuss their options with a Careers Scotland advisor. Many respondents also said they would want to get general information from them and use the website. A smaller proportion of respondents in each case said they would need help with things like filling in application forms or preparing a CV. This may suggest that while many clients continue to value the opportunity to discuss their options with a trained advisor, a much smaller proportion require very active, practical support such as help filling in forms etc.

Table 2.20: Kinds of things would use Careers Scotland (% of respondents likely to use CS in given situation)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>… if considering a career move</th>
<th>… if wanted to find out about education or training options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Discussion about options with a Careers Scotland advisor</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General information – e.g. leaflets, info from the internet</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To use the website</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with things like filling in application forms or preparing a CV</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BASE 306 299
## ANNEX 3  SUMMARY OF PROVISION BEFORE AAG

### PROVISION PRIOR TO INTRODUCTION OF AAG PROJECTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Argyll and Bute</td>
<td>Career Guidance for adults in A&amp;B very limited. Previously two FTEs but reduced to 0.5 FTEs in each of the area’s three offices. Some specific initiatives but limited by resources even in delivering New Deal activities. Some voluntary provision</td>
<td>Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayrshire</td>
<td>Ayrshire Adult Guidance unit provides core adult guidance and manages the AGN. The AGU has three staff that provide all the support. The biggest groups are those in employment or short term unemployed. There are a further five area initiatives including work with SIPs. Overall, gaps among excluded groups and limited cohesion across the area.</td>
<td>Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borders</td>
<td>Very limited – Equivalent of 0.5 of an adviser delivered by three people (1999/2000 326 interviews carried out). Further adult guidance post in Scottish Borders Council’s Pathways Adult Guidance Service. Advice also provided by Hereto Watt University on Borders Campus in Galashiels.</td>
<td>Very limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>Good – the Adult Learning Information and Guidance Service (ALIGS) is a partnership arrangement between the region’s stakeholders. The network offered 36 information points through the region. This is supported by frontline services delivered by ALIG partners. ALIGS is also supported by a website and helpline. There are a number of community based projects targeted at specific groups. Gaps identified are primarily with excluded groups.</td>
<td>Good</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dumfries and Galloway

Extremely limited, one adviser provided guidance through local colleges, otherwise limited to New Deal Gateway work carried out by D&G Career Service

Very limited

Dunbartonshire and Lomond

One adviser funded to work with adults. New Deal Gateway. Guidance available through Clydebank College and through specific projects such as Job Link.

Limited

Fife

Fairly good coverage through a network of Opportunity Centres co-ordinated by Fife Council Community Services. In addition services provided at Colleges and St Andrews University. Also some voluntary support as well as a great deal of partnership activity.

Good

Glasgow

Although there are significant levels of provision of information, advice and employability support across Glasgow, impartial, quality assured careers guidance provision is under developed for unemployed outwith New Deal. It is non-existent in some geographical areas, gaps for certain groups and significant underprovision for those in work.

Fair

Support has been available through, supplementary services to FE colleges, Local Development Companies and for parents of children attending community schools. There has also been advice for prisoners in Barlinnie and through some voluntary organisations. Continuing Education Gateway offers a Careersline and has advisers and there are also advisers at the three universities.

Grampian

6 FTE staff in non-statutory careers guidance for adults, a website had been developed. As well as New Deal Gateway activity there is a NESAE Adult Guidance initiative across three council areas for non-traditional participants. And Stepahead a subsidiary of the LEC to provide information and advice on training and careers (2.5 FTEs)

Fair

Provision of adult guidance services access is patchy and access to both statutory careers guidance services and employment service provision depends on economic and educational status as well as geographic factors.

Area

Comment

Conclusion

Lanarkshire

Limited – adhoc provision with Lanarkshire Career Service main provider, narrow focus to funding, e-guidance being developed and some modest LEC activity. Delivery of some guidance through New Deal Enhanced Gateway (18 -24) and Gateway to Work as well as enhanced FE

Limited
guidance service offered through Motherwell college

Highland

Provision of Adult Guidance Services is not evenly distributed. There is some LEC funding for adult careers guidance outwith the Careers Service core client group and New Deal in Ross and Cromarty, Inverness and Nairn and Badenoch and Strathspey (later to include Moray to form MBSE)

In CASE, delivery of information only service. In RACE and INE, the Career Service provide professional careers guidance. In Lochaber, Primarily information and advice, rather than guidance service

Skye and Lochalsh activity has been limited to a local partnership delivering information and advice

Badenoch and Strathspey service provided through Grampian Careers.

Lothian

Reasonably good, if inconsistent provision based on geography, funding, Local Authority priorities. Limited coherence. A helpline has been developed with 2,200 users. Careers Service provides service in Edinburgh and funded by Local authority. There has also been a close relationship with the universities which have received supplementary support.

Orkney

Comprehensive adult guidance service through the Orkney Opportunity Centre, supported through a partnership of the LEC and the Local Authority. Delivered 287 guidance interviews a year.

Renfrewshire

In addition to New Deal and statutory activity, Renfrewshire Careers provides a service that is available to all but take up has been fragmented. Covers those in employment as well as out of work. Development of web service, work with colleges.

Area | Comment | Conclusion
--- | --- | ---
Shetland | Limited service provided through Shetland Adult Guidance Delivery and Network development project supported by ESF and the LEC. Works with local communities, particularly in remote areas, but partnership projects and New Deal mean that capacity for delivery has been reached | Fair
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tayside</td>
<td>Limited – New Directions funded through LEC focused only on Dundee, modest support through informal partnership arrangements. Tayside Careers Partnership deliver New Deal Gateway.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Isles</td>
<td>In the Western Isles there was an ESF project in partnership with WIE and a New Deal Gateway contract. One careers adviser was based in Stornoway to deliver project services to adults.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 4 OMNIBUS PERCEPTIONS DATA FOR ORGANISATIONS 2002 -2004

Figure 1.1: How much do you know about the services available from each of the following? Learndirect Scotland

Figure 1.2: How much do you know about the services available from each of the following? The Scottish Learning Centre
Figure 1.3: How much do you know about the services available from each of the following? Careers Scotland

Figure 1.4: How much do you know about the services available from each of the following? The local Job Centre
Figure 1.5: How much do you know about the services available from each of the following? Scottish University for Industry

Figure 1.6: How much do you know about the services available from each of the following? Local Colleges/Learning Institutes
Tayside Careers AAG project

Tayside has a long tradition of guidance provision. The Tayside AGN started in 1991 attracting various funding sources until 1997 when more formal Scottish Office funding was received. The AGN comprised 65 organisations (colleges, universities, employment service, SET, careers company etc.). Prior to the successful application to deliver an AAG service, provision of adult guidance was fairly modest. The only source of adult guidance was provided by New Directions, an SE Tayside initiative which focussed on Dundee. Tayside Careers Ltd provided young people’s advice and guidance but not adult guidance. The Tayside Careers Ltd bid specifically targeted traditional non-participant groups including rural areas and socially excluded groups in urban areas. Among those in employment the emphasis has been on redundancy programmes.

Their bid was initially for just over £1m which, after negotiation, became an award of £655,000 over three years. The funds have been used mainly to appoint six new members of staff. The Tayside area is broken down into three areas Angus, Perth and Dundee and each area is developing a plan, with the local colleges key to both the delivery of training and contact with clients.

The project started in April 2001 and it has operated fairly independently for the first two years. Now in the third year, the project is becoming increasingly integrated with Career Scotland and an exit strategy is being developed. The six staff have worked full time on AAG project activity and have, until recently, been considered to be separate from staff delivering more traditional services.

The clients that Project staff work with are considered to be new or additional to the system. Because adult guidance provision was so limited initially and also because much of the work that the Project has done has been based on reaching genuinely new client groups, it is likely that most of the clients would not have used the existing provision. The project staff are working with different people and approaching work in different ways. The emphasis has been on using alternative methods e.g. groups and working with partners rather than traditional one-to-one interviews.

The result has been a broadening of the scope of work for all staff to incorporate the activities pioneered as part of the project. Non-project staff are learning by shadowing Project staff and these new activities will now continue to be an important part of Careers Scotland activity.

The approach adopted by Careers Scotland is driven by the needs of clients rather than restricted by the traditional barriers caused by staff working within their own area. A lot of the work in the second year has been on changing staff attitudes, with the emphasis on targeting key groups, developing new skills and breaking down the boxes that the old service used to work within.

Careers Scotland is now in a position to be able to distribute resources more effectively among client groups where it can make the biggest difference. The projects have acted as a precursor to this. The third year is crucial with a lot of staff development work and an increasing engagement with Community Learning Development Plans with local guidance partners.

The lessons from the projects will be carried into the work of Careers Scotland. The extent to which they have achieved objectives with hard to reach groups is limited by resources, but there has certainly been progress. Generally, Career Scotland needs to learn more from experiences across the country. There has also been a lot of learning through partner organisations, particularly in using the AGN partners to learn how to target specific groups. Equally, its is also providing learning for these partners.
Edinburgh and Lothian AAG project

Prior to the project Edinburgh already had an adult guidance service with 3 - 4 advisers supported by a range of sources. The service was considered to be reasonably advanced compared with other areas of the country and their bid was intended to build on this and fill some of the gaps. The bid was based around four themes:

- Better use of technology
- Community based guidance
- Working with partner agencies
- Consistency of guidance

The project targeted disadvantaged groups and also graduates, including those graduating several years ago and not served by the HIEs. The additional funding brought a further 10 FTE staff, all based in Edinburgh, but who spent time in each of the local offices as well as working on a new helpline. The project also used resources to develop a web-based service. Under the project, there was an increased presence in local communities in the three local authority areas outside Edinburgh, East Lothian, West Lothian and Midlothian as well as small amounts of funding to continue to help support the FEIs and HIE guidance work. With the arrival of Careers Scotland, the approach to working in the community has changed. Now, rather than have advisers visiting, they are based in the local offices. In operational terms the Career Service Company had integrated the project into its own work, as a separate unit, and so some of the issues of partnership and institutional clutter that were faced by other bids were avoided.

One of the aims of the project was to be more active in working with partners and serving hard to reach groups. While there has been more dynamic use of group work there have been problems in getting suitable premises. There has been a strong link with the AGN and the project has continued to provide some funding and work with them as well as seeking to use partners’ experience in reaching specific groups. It is difficult to be specific about how well this has worked as the client base data has not been analysed in the detail needed to demonstrate the take up by hard to reach groups.

There is also now increasing engagement in the Community Planning process with specific involvement with the development of Community Learning Plans in Leith and Wester Hailes.

The development of the web-service and helpline allowed the project to start to differentiate between the needs of clients and to think more carefully about the level of service required. Both of these services acted as filters to identify the needs of clients rather than simply offering interviews. This emphasis on self-help services is now a crucial part of Career Scotland’s business model.

Overall the project provided a major step forward for the delivery of adult guidance in the area. It allowed CDE&L to provide a much more effective service to certain groups and to develop several new initiatives. The introduction of Career Scotland was both a benefit and a challenge for the project. While it brought consistency, branding and quality standards, it also meant that the initiatives that had been developed, particularly the web-service and the helpline were not taken further locally. The project had built a very strong sense of partnership and local ownership which to some extent was reduced with the introduction of Career Scotland.
Scottish Borders AAG

The Scottish Borders’ AAG project was set up in an area where historically small scale initiatives enabled provision to limited numbers of people. In parts of the Borders – especially in rural areas- there was little or no access to adult guidance. The importance of introducing the idea of lifetime career planning was recognised by the project as pre-cursor to the role developed by Careers Scotland.

Through the project individuals have been provided with insight into the career planning process. This means that clients need to understand the methodology of the Career Planning Continuum (CPC) the eleven stage process whereby the client is engaged in his/her own career planning. Enabling people to understand the process is critical to their progress.

The project had strong emphasis on access. The development of a geographically and socially inclusive AAG project was a priority. New locations were created, materials developed and staff provided. Partnership working meant that an improved service was possible. In practical terms this resulted in co-location of staff in local authority accommodation and reciprocal referral arrangements.

The exit strategy for the project has been to mainstream AAG work into the activities of Careers Scotland. AAG career advisers have been helpful in training other Careers Scotland staff. This has assisted in the integration of staff into more generic teams.

Dunbartonshire & Lomond AAG

The Dunbartonshire and Lomond AAG project incorporated adult guidance and the New Deal within the area. The AAG developed a strong SIP link and this, along with partnership working more generally has absorbed effort and time Outreach was to be a priority and the means of achieving it were several.

Initial effort went into placing the 7 AAG advisers across the area. Eventually 20 venues were opened – often in premises provided by partner organisations.

It was accepted from the start that AAG’s limited resources would be stretched by demand. To address this the project made use of its partners resources. One notable feature of the project was the capacity building carried out through the training of partners staff. This made possible the level of outreach activity across the large number of new outlets.

In support of this a Practitioners Handbook was devised. It is employed widely as a directory of guidance learning, training and specialist support in the area.

The project exit strategy has been to bring AAG staff into the Careers Scotland area teams. A degree of specialism has been retained, principally due to the view that although careers guidance needs are similar for all ages, there is a need to maintain different networks required for successful adult guidance.
ANNEX 6 INDIVIDUAL CASE STUDIES

Case study 1: Jenny

Jenny left school with 5 Highers and went on to take a Biotechnology course at college. She left the course after deciding that this was not the correct career path for her. She found work at a local supermarket but after six years decided it was time to look for an alternative career and she was referred to Careers Scotland by her local Community Education department. Three interviews followed, which took place in a local school as access to the nearest Careers Scotland Centre was difficult. Each interview lasted 2-3 hours and covered various activities including: a personality test that provided her with a variety of options to consider; discussion on the most appropriate career choice; information on course provision and; some assistance in creating a CV. Jenny was delighted that there was no limit to the time offered to assist her in making the right decision.

Through the guidance process Jenny decided to aim for a career in Primary school teaching and was ready to begin when she became pregnant. She has consequently decided to wait until her child is older before embarking on the full training. In the meantime she is undertaking short courses related to Primary teaching to keep her mind active. She is currently taking open learning courses in psychology, child oriented care and learning through play.

Jenny feels that with the help of Careers Scotland she has regained her confidence and has a much clearer career goal to aim for. She was particularly impressed with the friendly and approachable manner of the Careers Adviser and the quality of guidance and information offered, particularly as the service is free.

Case study 2: Sarah

After working for 6 years, Sarah was told that she would soon be made redundant as the company was facing closure. In preparation for the redundancy a number of agencies, including Careers Scotland, visited the company to offer the workforce information, advice on other opportunities that were available and job search help. Sarah welcomed this and as part of this process she received a 15-20 minute interview with a Careers Advisor. She was really keen to get advice on alternative job opportunities to enable her to secure employment. The advice given, however, focused on information on further training and college courses. She felt that this advice did not meet her expectations and was consequently disappointed with the service provided.

Apart from gaining useful advice on completing a CV from another agency, Sarah felt she was left on her own to try to find another job and for the first time used recruitment agencies and the Internet to identify job opportunities. She has managed to secure a range of temporary contracts as a result of her job search endeavours and is now considering a career in the care sector.

Sarah would have liked more information from Careers Scotland on the type of jobs available locally, advice on job search generally and a list of recruitment agencies and Internet web sites that she could use for job search.
Case study 3: Rebecca

Rebecca first visited Careers Scotland in the summer of 2001, when she was working part time as a cleaner and as a child-minder. She fitted these activities around her two children but wanted to increase her hours and earning potential. She saw an advert for Careers Scotland in the paper.

Rebecca’s contact with Careers Scotland was always by telephone. As a result of the advice provided she joined an IT course and Careers Scotland loaned her a computer for a three month period to enable her to complete the relevant modules. Rebecca was unable to finish the course as her cleaning workload began to pick up. She consequently approached her local enterprise company and she set up her own cleaning business.

She was very happy with the service she received and acknowledges that the knowledge she gained from her IT course was helpful. She does feel, however, that more information could be provided over the web and that the course itself was aimed at too low a standard initially. She would use Careers Scotland in the future if she ever wanted more careers advice.

Case study 4: Elspeth

After hearing about the service from a friend, Elspeth phoned Careers Scotland in the summer of 2002 for some assistance in preparing her CV for a specific job application and some help with her interview technique.

After her initial contact she attended two subsequent face to face interviews at the Careers Scotland offices. During these meetings she was given support in preparing a CV and in improving her interview techniques. She was also given some practical information about courses in Information Technology (IT).

Elspeth is still working in the same catering job that she had in 2002 and she has now completed the IT training course recommended to her by Careers Scotland. She is continuing to look for alternative employment but notes that employment prospects in her rural locality are fairly limited.

Elspeth found the support provided by Careers Scotland to be extremely helpful, especially the face to face contact, and feels that the process has boosted her confidence and ambitions. She has also developed long term career skills in CV preparation and interview techniques. Elspeth feels that she will definitely use the service again in the future.
Case study 5: John

John left school with little idea as to his career options. He was interested in finding employment or in engaging in further training and was working in the hotel sector. He contacted Step Ahead (Aberdeen’s career service) prior to contacting Careers Scotland in 2001.

He had several sessions with Careers Scotland and support included information provision, advice and guidance. He was supporting in developing his CV and was provided with lists of recruitment agencies. Feedback from these agencies revealed that without qualifications his prospects were limited. John is now in year 2 of an HND in accounting at Aberdeen College which he read about in the local paper.

John is full of praise for Careers Scotland. He felt that they provided practical help which enabled him to progress at a time when he was unclear as to his options. John is about to complete his diploma and he could go on to University and get into third year accountancy but is more likely to join an accountancy firm and work towards his chartered accountancy exams. He feels that his career options are now clear and that he will not need to contact Careers Scotland again.

Careers Scotland played a key role in helping John reach his present course and leading him into the right area. He would not have known what to do otherwise.

Case study 6: Shona

Shona approached Careers Scotland early in 2002 when she was interested in a career change. She had ideas on various career options and sought advice on these. They ranged from being a wedding planner, to involvement in the sports industry, to training to be a primary school teacher.

Shona had contact with Careers Scotland over a substantial period of time, during which she established that her interests lay in teaching and coaching. Her initial action was to study for a teaching diploma that would then allow her to become a primary school teacher. She enjoyed the learning experience but found that this did not suit her for health reasons.

Subsequently she has completed a massage therapy course and is now going into business and continuing to study for a more specialised course that will enable her to become a sports massage therapist. Shona was fairly clear as to what she wanted to do but needed specialist advice, which is why she turned to Careers Scotland.

Careers Scotland has played a minor yet positive role in her career change. She found them to be a useful resource in supporting her to find her own way forward.
Case study 7: Julie

Julie wanted information on how to get on a course as a mature student in order to train to be a primary school teacher. After finding the details of Careers Scotland in the phone book she had a personal interview to explore the different options for training to be a teacher. During this meeting the adviser called different educational institutions to look at grants and entrance requirements. As a result of this search, it was recommended that Julie do an access course. She then followed up on the interview with a number of phone calls to her adviser to talk through her financial options and the adviser helped her to locate bursaries for single parents.

Julie found that the advice was invaluable as it put her on the right road. She did not have to wait too long for an appointment and Careers Scotland was flexible in fitting the appointment around her childcare needs. Julie continues to work as a registered child minder and is currently finishing her access course and has a place booked on a teacher training course in the future. Eventually Julie would now like to be an educational psychologist.

Careers Scotland provided a key role as Julie wouldn’t have known how to find the relevant access courses or funding and wouldn’t have had the confidence to make the necessary calls to different colleges herself. Careers Scotland provided her with confirmation that she was following the right path and this made her feel more confident in her decision to retrain. Julie would definitely contact Careers Scotland again if she needed advice or help.

Case study 8: Anne

Anne had just become a single parent and needed to increase her income. She approached Careers Scotland as she wanted to explore her options in terms of finding work or starting a training programme. She was referred to Careers Scotland by a ‘Learn Direct’ television commercial and wanted to find out what she might be interested in doing and to get some help updating her CV.

Anne met with Careers Scotland in Autumn 2002 to discuss her situation. Training to be a careers adviser came up as a career option. Careers Scotland gave her information on different courses and advice as to where to look for funding. The adviser also gave Anne tips for improving her CV and she returned with a completed version. She was also provided with documents on interview techniques.

Anne found the service to be very effective and has recommended it to friends. She felt that while it wasn’t Careers Scotland that directly helped her find work, her improved CV was of great benefit and Careers Scotland confirmed that she was looking to work in the right sector which boosted her confidence. She also felt that it would be useful for Careers Scotland to do more advertising about the different range of services they provide.

Anne contacted different courses to train to be a careers’ adviser but unfortunately she had just missed the intake. She has now joined an employment agency and is currently working part time in the Human Resources department of a national charity. When her child is older Anne would potentially like to re-train and would contact Careers Scotland for support in finding courses and grants.
Case study 9: James

James had spent 30 years working in industry, the last twelve of which were in senior management, before he was made redundant. He consequently applied for many different posts, at lower levels and also in different industries, but was unsuccessful. This made him very frustrated. He consequently decided to look for work in a different sector and contacted Careers Scotland after finding their details through a web search. He had two meetings with them in June and July 2002. In the first meeting he used a computer package to develop a profile and a list of potential career options, including nursing. In the second interview, James completed the profile and the adviser called a college to make an appointment to talk through applying for an access course in nursing. He also received guidance on updating his CV to make it more appealing to the current job market.

After his visits to Careers Scotland, James applied to a University and was accepted on the nursing course. He is now six months into the course and is finding it to be very rewarding.

In the future, James would like to manage an NHS service, using his management skills to complement his current career choice. He would definitely use Careers’ Scotland again if he wanted to look for a different career option.

James feels that Careers Scotland provided invaluable support after his redundancy through offering a fresh perspective and a list of options that he had never considered.

Case study 10: Emma

Having been a teacher for 20 years, Emma was looking for a change of career and contacted Careers Scotland to assess her options. She used to be a careers’ officer herself and so was aware that the service existed. She had an initial chat by telephone in November 2002 before returning to use a computer package to help assess her options. The results were then sent to her and a follow up call was promised, which never came.

While the computer programme was helpful, Emma felt that the support offered was ‘focussed on an ideal world’. Suggestions were not linked to the realities of living in the rural locality where there were limited opportunities. Instead, they tried to help her find her ideal career rather than a match with vacancies and local opportunities.

Emma is now working part time for the Citizens’ Advice Bureau and is very happy, but is not convinced that she has found her niche. She would like to be promoted to bureau manager and work full time and is doing training to improve her promotion chances. Careers Scotland’s computerised package suggested this voluntary sector work and encouraged Emma to think more widely. She has encouraged other people to use the computerised package since.
Case study 11: Paul

Paul moved up to Scotland from the North East of England in 1993, having worked in a shipyard. He worked in a number of jobs before moving to Edinburgh to work as a bike courier. He enjoyed this for several years but felt that he would like an opportunity to do more, particularly intellectually.

He had always assumed that there was a service available for careers advice and used the Yellow Pages to find Careers Scotland. He considered applying for work at sea and related to the oil-industry and after speaking to an adviser contacted an Edinburgh College to find out more about an engineering course. Nobody from the College contacted him after an initial meeting. He received help with producing a CV, used the computer programme and also did some research at the central library.

About the same time his brother in law offered him a chance to work for a new business he was starting cleaning upholstery and carpets for commercial property. Paul took the position and is now hoping that it will give him an opportunity to take on a management role.

His experience of Careers Scotland was very positive although ultimately, the job he took came about by chance rather than through following up the advice he received. He felt that the service had also given him more confidence to look for opportunities and he would definitely use it again in the future, particularly the face to face discussions with advisers.

Case study 12: Jonathan

Jonathan contacted Careers Scotland after a second redundancy, once from the merchant navy and then from the oil industry. He had two meetings with Careers Scotland during which he talked through his situation. He then went through the computerised package, which confirmed that he had been in the ideal career of his choice. Careers Scotland provided Jonathan with a £300 grant to do a course to renew his radio operators’ licence.

According to Jonathan: ‘While there was nothing specific I received some excellent moral support in a dreadful situation. I left with a less negative feeling about my situation. They pointed out that I wasn’t alone, that my situation was not uncommon and they encouraged me to be realistic and to look at my options’. The grant was also useful and the radio licence allowed Jonathan to get a month’s worth of oil rig work in Canada. The computer programme was less helpful as it just confirmed that he had been in the ideal job.

Jonathan was very satisfied with the support received from Careers Scotland, although there were no identifiable outcomes in terms of finding work. He is now working as an ambulance dispatcher through 999 services. He has a regular salary and a pension. His salary is half what it was on the rigs but at least he has stability. He feels he has found a niche that suits his background.

The moral support and reassurance that Jonathan received from Careers Scotland was key to his coming out of a deep depression caused by his redundancy. The experience gave him confidence and enthusiasm about finding more work. It gave him the impetus to get his ‘head above the parapet’ and to find work in an industry that wasn’t in decline.
Case study 13: Deidre

Until recently Deidre and her husband ran a pub outside Glasgow, but in 2002, they sold the business. She had been a teacher previously and when the business was sold she considered going back into teaching. She had not been sure who to contact until a friend suggested Careers Scotland. On her first visit there was no-one able to see her. The one adviser was off sick, but after 2 weeks she managed to get an appointment which was interrupted by a fire alarm. She was given literature about applying for teaching posts, but was concerned that since her last experience, things had changed a great deal. Instead she started to investigate the options for working with people with special needs. The adviser guided her toward getting voluntary experience, but she did not feel that this was helpful.

While the support in refining her CV was useful, she did not feel that Careers Scotland really understood what she wanted and that she was treated more as a “statistic”. During that time she was also working part-time at a local college and has continued doing this, carrying out invigilating work and providing support for students. She has also been applying for jobs in special needs education and now has plans to develop a business to provide exercise for children.

Overall Deidre found that some of the practical elements of the service were useful but not the advice. She feels she should have been more assertive to get more out of the service. It certainly galvanised her into doing something even if this was different. She now feels clearer about her choices and the process has given her more confidence to make career decisions in the future.